## Agenda - Petitions Committee

Meeting Venue: For further information contact:

Video Conference via Zoom Graeme Francis - Committee Clerk

Meeting date: 13 October 2020 Kayleigh Imperato - Deputy Clerk

Meeting time: 09.00 0300 200 6565373

Petitions@senedd.wales

In accordance with Standing Order 34.19, the Chair has determined that the public are excluded from the Committee's meeting in order to protect public health. This meeting will be broadcast live on www.senedd.tv

- 1 Introduction, apologies, substitutions and declarations of interest (09.00) (Pages 1 34)
- 2 New COVID-19 Petitions

(9.00 - 9.20)

2.1 P-05-997 Give Citizens of Wales use and access to the German Track and Trace APP! We can't wait for England!

(Pages 35 - 36)

- 2.2 P-05-1014 Give Dental practices and their staff the "key worker" status

  (Pages 37 41)
- 2.3 P-05-1021 Do not make face masks or face coverings mandatory in ANY (inc secondary) schools

(Pages 42 - 49)

2.4 P-05-1025 Ensure fairness for students taking exams in 2021

(Pages 50 - 62)

2.5 P-05-1027 Allow Welsh domestic football clubs to play friendlies and allow supporters to attend matches

(Pages 63 – 69)



2.6 P-05-1028 Relax the excessive restrictions to allow motor sport rallies to take place in Wales

(Pages 70 - 75)

3 Evidence Session – P-05-886 Stop the Red Route (A55/A494 corridor)

(09.30 – 10.00) (Pages 76 – 106)

Ken Skates - Minister for Economy, Transport and North Wales

Andy Falleyn - Deputy Director Infrastructure Delivery

4 Other New Petitions

(10.00 - 10.10)

4.1 P-05-1022 To follow the Scottish Parliament and have LGBTQ Welsh history taught in all Welsh schools

(Pages 107 – 117)

4.2 P-05-1023 Welsh Government funding for recycling bins and collections in all education settings in Wales

(Pages 118 – 125)

4.3 P-05-1026 Petition to ban the snaring of wildlife for use in the fur trade

(Pages 126 - 140)

5 Updates to previous petitions

(10.10 - 10.30)

**Environment, Energy and Rural Affairs** 

- 5.1 P-05-825 Protect children's lungs from harmful pollution whilst at school (Pages 141 149)
- 5.2 P-05-937 STOP BOILING CRUSTACEANS ALIVE (lobsters, crabs, crayfish, prawns etc)

(Pages 150 – 159)

5.3 P-05-963 Require supermarkets to donate excess food to charity

(Pages 160 – 163)

#### **Equality**

5.4 P-05-798 Male domestic violence victim support services to be independently run & funded

(Pages 164 - 170)

#### **Health and Social Services**

5.5 P-05-906 Save Sam Davies Ward at Barry Hospital

(Pages 171 - 174)

#### Petitions with no recent contact from the petitioner

5.6 P-05-743 End the Exotic Pet Trade in Wales

(Pages 175 – 180)

5.7 P-05-864 Ban the use of 'Hostile Architecture

(Pages 181 – 182)

6 Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to resolve to exclude the public from the meeting for the following business:

(10.30)

Item 7

7 Discussion of Evidence Session – P–05–886 Stop the Red Route (A55/A494 corridor)

(10.30 - 11.00)

## Agenda Item 1

Document is Restricted

## Agenda Item 2.1

## P-05-997 Give Citizens of Wales use and access to the German Track and Trace APP! We can't wait for England!

This petition was submitted by Thomas Rex having collected a total of 62 signatures.

#### Text of Petition:

The UK Government have wasted £12million on developing a Trace and Trace APP and it is no where near ready.

Sir Kier Starmer at Prime Ministers Questions cited a German APP which is ready and in use. As we are still part of the EU it should meet GDPR requirements.

The App will allow Wales to control Covid in a targetted way.

#### Senedd Constituency and Region

- Brecon and Radnorshire
- Mid and West Wales

Vaughan Gething AS/MS Y Gweinidog lechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Minister for Health and Social Services



Ein cyf/Our ref VG/05264/20

Janet Finch-Saunders MS Chair, Petitions Committee

2 October 2020

Dear Janet,

Thank you for your letter of 27 July on behalf of the Petition Committee regarding use of the German Track and Trace app in Wales.

My officials have considered options for providing a Covid-19 proximity tracking app in Wales, working closely with counterparts in England, Scotland and Northern Ireland.

On 11 September I confirmed that the NHS Covid-19 App would be launched in Wales and England on 24<sup>th</sup> September. <a href="https://gov.wales/businesses-urged-prepare-nhs-covid-19-app">https://gov.wales/businesses-urged-prepare-nhs-covid-19-app</a>

I hope that the NHS Covid-19 App will be widely used, to complement existing Test, Trace, Protect services and help to reduce the spread of covid-19 in Wales.

I hope this information is helpful.

Yours sincerely,

Vaughan Gething AS/MS

Vaufrar Gethin

Y Gweinidog lechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Minister for Health and Social Services

Canolfan Cyswllt Cyntaf / First Point of Contact Centre: 0300 0604400

Gohebiaeth. Vaughan. Gething@llyw.cymru Correspondence. Vaughan. Gething@gov. wales

Bae Caerdydd • Cardiff Bay Caerdydd • Cardiff CF99 1SN

Rydym yn croesawu derbyn gohebiaeth yn Gymraeg. Byddwn yn ateb gohebiaeth a dderbynnir yn Gymraeg yn Gymraeg ac ni fydd gohebu yn Gymraeg yn arwain at oedi.

## Agenda Item 2.2

#### P-05-1014 Give Dental practices and their staff the "key worker" status

This petition was submitted by Owain Dimmick having collected a total of 233 signatures.

#### **Text of Petition:**

During the initial Covid-19 outbreak dental practices were staggered to be classed as "non essential medical" despite our roles saving lives through urgent infection care and early oral cancer detection. There are huge systemic risks associated with poor oral health which can't be ignored. We also don't want to be in a position again where our patients could be left in pain due to Welsh Government regulations severely limiting the range of emergency treatments possible.

#### Additional Information

For decades dentistry had lead the way with cross infection control and utilisation of PPE. Alongside social distancing waiting areas, dental practices have now equipped themselves with the highest level of PPE, including respirators and full gowns to ensure they protect themselves, their staff and their patients, mitigating the risks no matter what the infection rate in the locality is.

Please support us to continue to care for our patients and provide what we judge to be appropriate dental treatments even if local or national lockdown measure are re-introduced.

#### Senedd Constituency and Region

- Ceredigion
- Mid and West Wales

# Give Dental practices and their staff the "key worker" status

Y Pwyllgor Deisebau | 13 Hydref 2020 Petitions Committee | 13 October 2020

**Reference**: RS20/13682-4

Petition Number: P-05-1014

Petition title: Give Dental practices and their staff the "key worker" status

Text of petition: During the initial Covid-19 outbreak dental practices were staggered to be classed as "non essential medical" despite our roles saving lives through urgent infection care and early oral cancer detection. There are huge systemic risks associated with poor oral health which can't be ignored. We also don't want to be in a position again where our patients could be left in pain due to Welsh Government regulations severely limiting the range of emergency treatments possible.

For decades dentistry had lead the way with cross infection control and utilisation of PPE. Alongside social distancing waiting areas, dental practices have now equipped themselves with the highest level of PPE, including respirators and full gowns to ensure they protect themselves, their staff and their patients, mitigating the risks no matter what the infection rate in the locality is.

Please support us to continue to care for our patients and provide what we judge to be appropriate dental treatments even if local or national lockdown measure are re-introduced.



## 1. Background

On 17 March 2020, a <u>letter from the Chief Dental Officer (CDO) for Wales</u> stated that routine dentistry 'as normal' was no longer sustainable due to the coronavirus pandemic. Urgent Dental Centres (UDCs) were established across Wales and were staffed and equipped with enhanced personal protective equipment (PPE), for provision of emergency and urgent dental service provision in every Health Board.

The Welsh Government published <u>Dental care during the COVID-19 pandemic:</u> <u>guidance for teams</u> on 8 April 2020, which explained how dental teams should work from 23 March 2020 during the coronavirus pandemic.

The CDO noted in a <u>statement</u> on 6 June 2020 that dentists in Wales had remained open for urgent care throughout the lockdown. They had seen 10,000 people in practices and provided 125,000 consultations remotely, via phone or video services. Pain relief and antibiotics had continued to be prescribed where necessary.

Fifteen urgent dental care centres were opened covering the whole country. These centres provided emergency treatment to more than 4,000 people, which included extractions, opening teeth to drain abscesses and treating traumatic injuries.

A <u>Wales De-escalation Pandemic Plan for Dentistry</u> was published by the Welsh Government on 4 June 2020. This plan provided information on the <u>de-escalation</u> alert levels and what dental services would be available under each level. <u>Restoration of dental services following COVID-19: guidance</u> was also made available.

On 16 June 2020 the Welsh Government produced its <u>Standard Operating</u> <u>Process</u> for Non-COVID-19 Dental Centres Providing Aerosol Generating Procedures in Wales, which set out a Red/Amber/Green alert level structure for de-escalating the response to Covid-19.

The <u>Welsh Government confirmed</u> on 30 June 2020 that further services were being gradually reinstated, although it is likely to be some time before the full range of services – including those dental procedures that generate aerosols– will be reintroduced. Dental services were able to move to the amber phase of deescalation, meaning all dental practices in Wales were able to open from 22 June 2020 for urgent, non-aerosol care.

On 8 September 2020, the CDO <u>issued a statement</u> on local lockdown protocol for Wales, after Wales' first local lockdown in Caerphilly commenced. In the statement the CDO reiterated the fact that Wales remains in amber alert and consequently certain requirements still hold for dental services. The CDO went on to say that practices can oscillate between high and low amber based on local circumstances. In order to observe travel restrictions and local lockdown, practices need to concentrate on urgent and essential care and not invite patients to travel in or out of local lockdown area for routine care and assessment that can be delayed.

#### 2. Welsh Parliament action

The British Dental Association (BDA) Cymru gave evidence to the Health, Social Care and Sport Committee on <u>2 July 2020</u>. During the meeting, it was noted that dentists had not been explicitly listed as key workers on the Welsh Government website and there had been anecdotal evidence that some dentists, and more so their teams, were subsequently not able to access childcare during the pandemic.

Following its evidence to the Committee, BDA Cymru submitted <u>written evidence</u> to support the issues raised. This written evidence set out some areas where BDA Cymru would have liked immediate action to be taken, including:

#### Identify all dental team members as key workers

We need all practice staff, including private contractors, to be able to work and to provide care during the de-escalation period of lockdown. Without key worker status, many dentists are not eligible for childcare, especially as we head towards the summer holidays. Extending key worker status to the whole dental team is vital

The situation has changed since BDA Cymru submitted it's written evidence, but it is unclear what the status of dental team members would be in any future lockdown

Every effort is made to ensure that the information contained in this briefing is correct at the time of publication. Readers should be aware that these briefings are not necessarily updated or otherwise amended to reflect subsequent changes.

## Agenda Item 2.3

P-05-1021 Do not make face masks or face coverings mandatory in ANY (inc secondary) schools

This petition was submitted by Lindsey Jones having collected a total of 214 signatures.

#### Text of Petition:

There is so much evidence to suggest face masks do not stop the spread of viruses including COVID-19/coronavirus.

Masks promote the touching of faces repeatedly which will spread any pathogens that are on the mask. On the topic of masks, Dr Jenny Harries is quoted in saying "Because of human behavioural issues, people can adversely put themselves at more risk than less."

Many doctors & health professionals are speaking out to say face masks aid the spread of viruses.

#### Additional Information:

https://www.who.int/publications-detail-redirect/advice-on-the-use-of-masks-in-the-community-during-home-care-and-in-healthcare-settings-in-the-context-of-the-novel-coronavirus-(2019-ncov)-outbreak

https://wwwnc.cdc.gov/eid/article/26/5/19-0994\_article

https://swprs.org/face-masks-evidence/

https://bmjopen.bmj.com/content/5/4/e006577

#### Senedd Constituency and Region

- Monmouth
- South Wales East

## Face coverings in schools

Y Pwyllgor Deisebau | 13 Hydref 2020 Petitions Committee | 13 October 2020

Reference: RS20/14123-1

Petition number: P-05-1021

Petition title: Do not make face masks or face coverings mandatory in ANY

(inc secondary) schools

**Text of petition**: There is so much evidence to suggest face masks do not stop the spread of viruses including COVID-19/coronavirus.

Masks promote the touching of faces repeatedly which will spread any pathogens that are on the mask. On the topic of masks, Dr Jenny Harries is quoted in saying "Because of human behavioural issues, people can adversely put themselves at more risk than less."

Many doctors & health professionals are speaking out to say face masks aid the spread of viruses.



### 1. Summary

The Welsh Government revised its policy on face coverings in schools on 26 August 2020, and face coverings in society more generally on 11 September 2020.

Welsh Government guidance is updated regularly and Committee Members are advised to refer to the latest versions available.

## 2. Face coverings in schools

The Welsh Government updated its policy on face coverings in <u>schools on 26</u> August 2020.

The Welsh Government said that, while <u>scientific advice</u> indicates that face coverings are likely to be of little value in children under the age of 11 years, they are <u>recommended</u> for all members of the public aged over 11 in indoor settings in which social distancing cannot be maintained, including secondary schools.

Face coverings are therefore recommended for use in communal areas (corridors etc but not necessarily classrooms) in secondary schools but not primary schools.

Welsh Government <u>operational guidance to schools</u> (updated 2 September) states:

The Chief Medical Officer recommends, but does not mandate, the risk assessed use of face coverings in secondary schools in a range of settings where other physical controls cannot be or are unlikely to be maintained. This may include communal areas of schools where the physical layout means that contact groups cannot remain separated to the same degree. This will be a local decision for the school or setting depending on their assessment of the risk and in context of the local circumstances

The Minister was asked about face coverings in schools in <u>Plenary on 15</u> <u>September</u> and said:

> With regard to face coverings, the guidance is absolutely clear with regard to face coverings. Our expectations of schools and our operational guidance are that they will take steps within their school to limit contact between groups of students. And schools are doing this in a variety of ways: zoning, for instance; one-way systems; staggered starts; staggered break times, lunch times and end-of-school-day arrangements. Where, after all those other things have been done-because those things have to be done first—where those things have all been done and then it is impossible to keep bubbles of students apart in communal areas, that's when face coverings should be worn. And it is best that that is done on an individual risk-assessment basis within an individual school, because our schools come in all different shapes and sizes. There are high schools in my own constituency that would look like a small primary school in the context of Cardiff. We have some of our schools in wonderful twentyfirst century schools buildings, and then some of our schools are still, if I'm honest, Victorian structures, so your ability to achieve these things within your school will vary from school to school. If you cannot keep groups of students in communal areas 2m apart, then they should wear a face covering, and I'm sure that figuring that out is well within the capability of our headteachers who run our schools. They are dealing with much more complex problems every single day of their lives than figuring out whether they can keep children 2m apart in a corridor. [Bold is Senedd Research emphasis]

## 3. Face coverings in society more generally

The Welsh Government <u>announced on 11 September</u> that, from 14 September, the wearing of face coverings is <u>required in all indoor public places</u>, such as shops and shopping centres, hairdressers and gyms. The exception to this requirement is where a person is inside a place to eat or drink (for example, cafés, restaurants and pubs).

Children aged under 11 are not required to wear face coverings. This is because the **scientific advice** indicates that face coverings are likely to be of little value in children under the age of 11 years.

Every effort is made to ensure that the information contained in this briefing is correct at the time of publication. Readers should be aware that these briefings are not necessarily updated or otherwise amended to reflect subsequent changes.

Kirsty Williams AS/MS Y Gweinidog Addysg Minister for Education

Eich cyf/Your ref P-05-1021 Ein cyf/Our ref KW/05122/20

Chair, Petitions Committee

Janet Finch-Saunders MS



5 October 2020

Dear Janet,

Thank you for your letter dated 1 September regarding Petition P-05-1021, to not make face coverings mandatory in any (including secondary) schools.

I am grateful for the opportunity to share some views on this matter with the Petitions Committee in advance of the Committee's formal consideration of the petition.

The use of face coverings and personal protective equipment (PPE) more generally has been a frequent source of discussion during the pandemic. I appreciate many people have strong personal views on whether and in what circumstances face coverings should be worn. Global understanding of the virus has continually improved and this means we must be live to the latest scientific and medical advice in setting our policy; and equally must be open to reviewing the position as our understanding continues to develop.

You will be aware that on the 28 August I issued a joint statement alongside my colleague Vaughan Gething MS, Minister for Health and Social Services, on the use of face coverings in schools. This was done following advice from our Technical Advisory Cell who provided additional advice following an update from the World Health Organisation and our position was confirmed.

The wearing of face coverings in schools is not mandatory, the advice from our Chief Medical Officer is that face coverings are recommended for all members of the public over 11 years in indoor settings in which social distancing cannot be maintained, which may include schools and school transport.

As they have reopened to full capacity for the autumn, as well as considering the published operational guidance for schools and settings, schools have considered how to keep learners and staff safe in areas where the ability to social distance will not be possible or will

Canolfan Cyswllt Cyntaf / First Point of Contact Centre: 0300 0604400

Bae Caerdydd • Cardiff Bay Caerdydd • Cardiff CF99 1SN Gohebiaeth.Kirsty.Williams@llyw.cymru Correspondence.Kirsty.Williams@gov.wales

Rydym yn croesawu derbyn gohebiaeth yn Gymraeg. Byddwn yn ateb gohebiaeth a dderbynnir yn Gymraeg yn Gymraeg ac ni fydd gohebu yn Gymraeg yn arwain at oedi.

be a challenge, such as school corridors. As a result, many secondary schools have chosen to adopt a policy of wearing face-coverings as a mitigating measure. I applaud and support the adoption of local arrangements such as this.

I believe school leaders are best placed to make decisions relating to their schools, as they know their learners, their staff and their school environment. In arriving at decisions regarding the mitigating measures being introduced in their school, I know that head teachers will have undertaken a thorough and detailed risk assessment as outlined in the operational guidance, which will have included engaging with their local authority, staff and wider school community. By undertaking this process, schools will able to demonstrate that the decisions made for their school are appropriate and proportionate.

Considering the wellbeing of learners is critical to any considerations around whether staff or older learners wear face coverings. Our guidance is also clear that no one who may not be able to manage face coverings as directed, for example young learners or some learners with special educational needs or disabilities, should be required to wear them. The impact of wearing a face covering for learners with any level of hearing loss must also be carefully considered and our guidance links to advice provided by the National Deaf Children's Society to help schools and settings manage this appropriately.

The author of the petition refers to face coverings encouraging face touching, which can spread the virus. Our operational guidance details that schools should have a process for removing face coverings safely, including not touching the front of their face covering during use or when removing them, washing hands immediately on arrival (in the case of all learners), and disposing of or storing them safely. Further information on the wearing of face coverings can be found at the links that I have attached below.

Welsh - <a href="https://youtu.be/rDqnRYbiCM">https://youtu.be/rDqnRYbiCM</a> English - <a href="https://youtu.be/b5-QBMGKeKc">https://youtu.be/b5-QBMGKeKc</a>

There is a great deal that our schools and settings can do to reduce the risk of transmission and create as safe a space as possible for all learners to thrive. In the classroom, maintaining a safe distance between people and reducing the amount of time they are in face-to-face contact, lowers the risk of transmission. Ideally, adults should maintain a 2-metre distance from each other and from learners. It is strongly advised that staff in secondary schools maintain distance from their learners, staying away from colleagues where possible and staying at the front of the classroom. We know these measures will not always be practical, in particular with younger learners, but following the guidelines when circumstances allow will help reduce the risk of transmission.

It is important for our schools and settings to support learners to maintain a safe distance and not to touch staff and their peers where possible. Where this cannot be achieved, the transmission risk can still be reduced significantly by keeping learners in smaller, class-sized groups as outlined in our guidance.

In line with health advice, children under 11 no longer have to maintain a 2-metre distance from each other or from adults while at schools and settings. The advice remains that the risk to and from children under 11 is very low. However, they will remain subject to other restrictions in place and must continue to observe the social restrictions on meeting other family groups or wider gatherings for example.

Schools can make changes to the routine of the day, such as not holding large gatherings such as physical assemblies in one place, staggering break times, changing seating arrangements, increasing ventilation to indoor areas and holding activities in outdoor learning environments, where possible.

I understand this guidance will be welcomed by some and may cause concern for others. We must balance the overall risk to learners from COVID-19, which is very low, as well as the evidence of any substantial benefit from the use of face coverings, compared with the potential risks of incorrect use and disposal, against the concerns of parents and children and desire to wear face coverings. I would like to reassure the author of the petition that our advice on face coverings will be kept under constant review against the latest health and scientific evidence, including in context of new information released by the World Health Organisation.

Yours sincerely

**Kirsty Williams AS/MS** 

Y Gweinidog Addysg Minister for Education

## Agenda Item 2.4

#### P-05-1025 Ensure fairness for students taking exams in 2021

This petition was submitted by National Education Union Cymru having collected a total of 2,022 signatures.

#### **Text of Petition:**

As the Education Minister acknowledges, the last few weeks have been exceptionally hard for young people, who have already been disadvantaged by Covid-19. We welcome the Education Minister's apology. Now it is vital that the Welsh Government takes urgent steps to ensure students due to sit A-level, Welsh Baccalaureate and GCSE exams in 2021 are treated fairly and are not disadvantaged.

The planned independent review is very welcome, and we look forward to hearing further details.

#### Additional Information:

In Wales, with AS levels, and more focus on coursework, we have had a solid basis on which to judge students work. However, allowances must be made for the time students have missed in school or college.

It is clear to our members that Welsh Government needs to make changes to next year's exams to build confidence that the grades awarded, upon which young people's life chances are determined, properly recognise and reward their achievements.

We also believe that Welsh Government should now focus on:

- Reducing the curriculum content assessed across GCSE, Welsh Bacc and Alevel exams next summer, by making some topics optional across all subjects.
- Working with educators and trade unions to develop a Welsh system of moderated centre assessed grades in case there is further disruption to exams next summer.

• Using this opportunity to develop a robust system which ensures young people are rewarded for their achievements and not held back due to their background.

#### Senedd Constituency and Region

- Cardiff South and Penarth
- South Wales Central

## **Ensure fairness for students in 2021**

Y Pwyllgor Deisebau | 13 Hydref 2020 Petitions Committee | 13 October 2020

Reference: RS20/13898-4

Petition Number: P-05-1025

Petition title: Ensure fairness for students in 2021

**Text of petition:** As the Education Minister acknowledges, the last few weeks have been exceptionally hard for young people, who have already been disadvantaged by Covid-19. We welcome the Education Minister's apology. Now it is vital that the Welsh Government takes urgent steps to ensure students due to sit A-level, Welsh Baccalaureate and GCSE exams in 2021 are treated fairly and are not disadvantaged.

The planned independent review is very welcome, and we look forward to hearing further details.

Additional information: In Wales, with AS levels, and more focus on coursework, we have had a solid basis on which to judge students work. However, allowances must be made for the time students have missed in school or college.

It is clear to our members that Welsh Government needs to make changes to next year's exams to build confidence that the grades awarded, upon which young people's life chances are determined, properly recognise and reward their achievements.

We also believe that Welsh Government should now focus on:

- · Reducing the curriculum content assessed across GCSE, Welsh Bacc and A-level exams next summer, by making some topics optional across all subjects.
- · Working with educators and trade unions to develop a Welsh system of moderated centre assessed grades in case there is further disruption to exams next summer.



· Using this opportunity to develop a robust system which ensures young people are rewarded for their achievements and not held back due to their background.

## 1. Disruption to eduction due to COVID-19

On 20 March, schools closed for the provision of statutory education due to the national lockdown and social distancing requirements to deal with COVID-19. Schools remained open for children of key workers and vulnerable children, however the vast majority of pupils experienced substantial disruption to their education.

Schools were expected to provide for teaching and learning online, through the digital platform Hwb. However, it is widely recognised that learners due to take exams in 2021 have been significantly impacted in terms of their study towards these qualifications.

Background information on the disruption to education and to qualifications specifically can be found in Senedd Research blog articles of <u>16 June</u> and <u>7</u> <u>August</u> 2020.

## 2. Arrangements for qualifications awarded in 2021

As the Minister for Education, Kirsty Williams MS, reiterates in her letter to the Committee regarding the petition, the Welsh Government believes it is in the best interests of all learners for the exams in 2021 to proceed in the normal way, albeit with some modifications to take into consideration the loss of learning time and classroom time that have been experienced. The Minister told the Children, Young People and Education Committee in July 2020:

It is absolutely my hope and it is my belief that the examination series next summer needs to go ahead, but we need to recognise that some modifications will be necessary for that to be fair.

As the independent regulator, Qualifications Wales is responsible for determining arrangements for how qualifications are awarded. However, under the Qualifications Wales Act 2015, it must have regard to Welsh Government policy as directed by Ministers.

On <u>15 July</u>, Qualifications Wales issued instructions to the awarding body, WJEC, on how it should make appropriate changes to GCSEs and A levels for learners taking exams in summer 2021. Qualifications Wales issued further instructions to WJEC on <u>6 August 2020</u>.

On 1 September, <u>WJEC published details</u> of the adaptations it was putting in place for qualifications awarded in summer 2021.

The Welsh Government has commissioned an independent review into the events following the decision to cancel the summer 2020 exam series, due to COVID-19. The review is being chaired by Louise Casella, Director of the Open University in Wales. The Minister's <u>announcement of the review</u> stated:

It is essential that lessons are learned from this year's experience so that the review can provide recommendations and considerations for approaches for 2021.

The Minister has asked Louise Casella to provide her with an interim report of key findings by the end of October, with a final report and recommendations to follow by mid-December.

Every effort is made to ensure that the information contained in this briefing is correct at the time of publication. Readers should be aware that these briefings are not necessarily updated or otherwise amended to reflect subsequent changes.

Kirsty Williams AS/MS Y Gweinidog Addysg Minister for Education Hywodraeth Cymru

Ein cyf/Our ref: KW/05200/20

Llywodraeth Cymru Welsh Government

Janet Finch-Saunders MS Chair Petitions Committee Senedd Cardiff Bay Cardiff CF99 1NA

Petitions@Senedd.Wales

14 September 2020

Dear Janet,

Thank you for your letter dated 4 September regarding Petition P-05-1025 - "Ensure Fairness for Students in 2021" from the National Education Union.

The Petition sets out three areas on which the Petitioners believe there should be a focus.

The first refers to reducing the curriculum content assessed across GCSE, Welsh Baccalaureate, and A level exams next summer, by making some topics optional across all Subjects. I have been clear that I believe it is in the best interests of learners to take their exams next summer but that there should be some adaptations to take into account the disruption to teaching and learning, as well as social distancing considerations.

In July, Qualifications Wales established an extraordinary regulatory framework in July that allows WJEC to make adaptations to general qualifications next summer. On 1 September, WJEC published the adaptations that will be made to general qualifications in summer 2021, these were produced following detailed considerations on a subject specific basis and engagement with practitioners. These adaptations were provided to schools and colleges over the summer to facilitate their planning for the autumn term but have now been made publically available to help provide reassurance to learners and their families. I have enclosed a link to these documents for you:

#### https://www.wiec.co.uk/home/summer-2021-adaptations/

This approach will ensure that learners are provided with the opportunity to demonstrate their ability whilst recognising the disruption there has been to their teaching and learning. It will also seek to provide teachers more time to deliver course content, making the best use of the time available when schools resume, while ensuring the qualifications remain valid and meaningful.

Canolfan Cyswllt Cyntaf / First Point of Contact Centre: 0300 0604400

Gohebiaeth.Kirsty.Williams@llyw.cymru Correspondence.Kirsty.Williams@gov.wales

Bae Caerdydd • Cardiff Bay Caerdydd • Cardiff CF99 1SN

Rydym yn croesawu derbyn gohebiaeth yn Gymraeg. Byddwn yn ateb gohebiaeth a dderbynnir yn Gymraeg yn Gymraeg ac ni fydd gohebu yn Gymraeg yn arwain at oedi.

To support learners due to take their exams next year, they will be priority cohort support via our £29 million 'recruit, recover and raise standards plan'. This will enable recruitment of the equivalent of 600 extra teachers and 300 teaching assistants throughout the next school year, to provide extra coaching support, personalised learning programmes and additional time and resources for exam year pupils

The second point in the petition, refers to working with educators and trade unions to develop a Welsh system of moderated centre assessed grades in case there is further disruption to exams next summer. As we continue to operate in an uncertain public health environment, whilst we plan to proceed with examinations as normal in 2021, as a responsible Government it is only right that we also develop contingency arrangements in case of further disruption. Therefore, in July I asked Qualifications Wales and WJEC, to develop contingency arrangements in relation to exams, drawing on our experience and learning from this year. Lessons learned and proposals for 2021 will also be a key focus of the independent review which I announced on 28 August will be chaired by Louise Casella and is due to provide interim findings next month and a final report at the end of 2020.

The third point in the petition refers to the need to develop a robust system which ensures young people are rewarded for their achievements and not held back due to their background. You may be aware that Qualifications Wales has recently published a statement on its plans for further analysis of this summer's results and I have provided a link to this below:

https://qualificationswales.org/english/results-2020/qualifications-walesstatements/statement-on-plans-for-further-statistical-releases/

Qualifications Wales has now published an update to its results overview <a href="https://www.qualificationswales.org/english/news/revised-results-4-september/">https://www.qualificationswales.org/english/news/revised-results-4-september/</a>. This provides more accurate estimates of final results this summer for A levels, AS, GCSEs and the Skills Challenge certificate as well as comparisons to results in previous years and the proposed standardised grades. Qualifications Wales will also update the information on attainment gaps and expand it to include an analysis of results for learners with a special educational needs status and further information on results by ethnicity.

With regard to longer term implications of the arrangements this year, I have also asked for the review to note areas for further consideration and exploration as we start the transition to curriculum reform. This might include practitioners' approach to assessment, the role of accountability systems and the future role and design of qualifications. Qualifications Wales will also be consulting on their next phase of Qualified for the Future, which will inform the revision and development of qualifications to reflect the Curriculum for Wales, later this year

I hope that you will find this information helpful.

Yours sincerely

Kirsty Williams AS/MS Y Gweinidog Addysg

Minister for Education

## Petition P-05-1025 – "Ensure fairness for students in 2021" National Education Union Cymru

#### **Background**

NEU Cymru welcomes that the Petitions Committee are considering our petition (P-05-1025) on the 13<sup>th</sup> October and welcomes the opportunity to provide information to the Committee. We would be happy to give evidence to the Petitions Committee in person.

We think it would be remiss of us to comment on the attached document, without first highlighting that the impact on young people of the situation around exams this summer cannot be underestimated, and it is very important for our members that the situation in 2021 is hugely different. Grades need to reflect a learner's achievements, not their background or the school they attended. The Minister's letter is welcome, and highlights the actions Welsh Government are taking, though we still have some concerns, which we have set out below.

We would highlight that whilst the Senedd is currently considering the Curriculum and Assessment Bill, there is an opportunity to think now about how we measure learner performance for next year. This year has shown us we can't rely on exams taking place next year, and need to put a system in place for moderated teacher assessment.

We have attempted to respond to your questions below:

#### \* What are your thoughts on the attached document?

We welcome the measures which the Education Minister has highlighted in her letter. Our specific comments are set out below.

#### **Independent Review**

With regards to the Independent Review this is welcome. We especially welcome:

- reviewing what assessment methods are appropriate/fair for 2021
- considering whether there is "a role for a greater teacher and centre assessment contribution, which is proportionate to the need to prioritise teaching and learning time"
- looking at what they can learn from approaches taken to assessment and awarding of qualifications internationally

However, we would highlight the review may not give schools enough time to make adjustments for summer 2021. Any changes to be implemented from January would leave schools no more than the equivalent of three months (given half term and Easter holidays) before the current scheduled exam season starts.

With regards to our second bullet point above, in our response to Qualifications Wales' consultation in April on the arrangements for the summer 2020 exam series, our response to Question 6 was:

"We have serious concerns about the use of statistical standardisation models in relation to the setting of grade boundaries for GCSE and would seek reassurance about the robustness of the model to be applied. It must be noted that the academic ability of different cohort years in schools can vary considerably and that this must be considered when awarding the grades. This could mean that the current year 11 cohort might have considerably different estimated grades than those from the previous year. Failure to account for this could put the 2020 cohort of pupils at a disadvantage. Variation at centre level also happens in many years for reasons outside a centre or student's control and these factors will not be accounted for simply by considering historical centre outcomes. Education professionals know their students better than any historical data and therefore greater weight should be placed on the judgements of professionals."

However, Qualifications Wales (QW) decision was as follows:

"Having considered all the options available to us, and to ensure that grades being awarded, are as fair as possible given the extraordinary circumstances of this summer, we have decided that it would not be appropriate to allow centres to provide qualitative evidence to set out any exceptional circumstances they feel should be considered."

#### Also QW has said:

"There is a significant risk that if we give more weight to centre assessment grades to seek to mitigate these shortcomings, we will create a degree of unfairness for all centres and their learners."

The decision to revert to centre assessment grades, rather than award the standardised grades, shows that more emphasis should be placed

<sup>1</sup> https://www.qualificationswales.org/media/6181/arrangements-for-summer-2020-exam-series-decisions-taken-following-consultation.pdf (Response to Aim 3 – pages 14 - 18)

on the judgements of education professionals rather than a standardisation model.

#### **Duty**

We also note the duty associated with powers under the Covid Act, relating to Curriculum and assessment. We welcome that duties have been changed for September to 'reasonable endeavours'.<sup>2</sup> We would be concerned that the level of disruptions in schools associated with Covid—19 means there will be ongoing disruption to learning this school year, which must be reflected in curriculum content and exams.

#### Minister's letter

Whilst we believe the Minister's letter answers many of our members' concerns, there are still some issues which need addressing.

With regard to our second bullet point in our Petition, we would highlight that exams may need to be cancelled again next year:

 Working with educators and trade unions to develop a Welsh system of moderated centre assessed grades in case there is further disruption to exams next summer.

Whilst it is welcome that there is work underway, we understand that the Minister is focusing on exams going ahead next year. It would be our belief that this needs to operate alongside a plan for moderated centre assessed grades.

We believe that more attention also needs to be given to our third ask: "• Using this opportunity to develop a robust system which ensures young people are rewarded for their achievements and not held back due to their background."

We know that the Curriculum and Assessment Bill is currently at Stage 1, and have given evidence to the Children, Young People and Education Committee. Whilst we support this Bill in principle, we remain concerned that there needs to be an open and honest debate about assessment, especially the methodology used in moderation of exams.

Our members know that exams cannot be compared year-on-year. And yet it is often the case that exams are used as part of an accountability regime. More public engagement is needed to ensure that they understand the exams system is essentially a quota system, which allows a certain number of students to gain certain grades. Grade

<sup>2</sup> https://business.senedd.wales/documents/s104872/CLA5-25-20%20Paper%2031.pdf

\_

boundaries move every year. We believe this needs to be fully understood before we can seriously begin to look at what the exams system looks like in the future.

#### \* Do you have further questions in response?

We recognise that WJEC and QW have worked to reduce content across the exam suite<sup>3</sup>. However, we would highlight that there is a need for the WJEC to look again at GCSE and A level exams and ensure that each and every one has reduced curriculum content. We do not, for example, understand how you can reduce the content of A level French, but not any of the English exams?<sup>4</sup> Young people will need acknowledgement that they have missed time in school regardless of the subject they are studying.

We would welcome that WJEC has been asked to adapt exams for next year to "seek to ensure learners are not disadvantaged". However, we would take issue with the following two principles, as we do not feel they are in-keeping with the other principles, and we believe will result in more unfairness:

- "3. WJEC must seek to ensure that qualification content, in general, is not reduced; however, content can be restructured so it can reasonably be streamlined, such as in relation to optional units.
- 4. WJEC must seek to ensure that the manageability of assessment is maximised, where this will allow for an increase in teaching time in order to minimise the impact on outcomes."<sup>5</sup>

Again, we would highlight that students have had a significantly difficult time in the past few months, and everything must now be done to ensure they are not disadvantaged. If content isn't being reduced, the degree of optionality in the examination papers should be increased.

We would also be concerned that the number of young people Not in Education, Employment or Training (NEET<sup>6</sup>) is high in Wales. We would be concerned that the current situation with Covid-19 and uncertainty around exams may make this situation worse. We believe that raising the compulsory school age to 18 should be considered.

#### **Vocational Qualifications**

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> https://www.wjec.co.uk/home/summer-2021-adaptations/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> https://www.wjec.co.uk/media/qvvldboy/wjec-gce-adaptations-booklet-e-01-09-20.pdf

<sup>5</sup> https://www.wjec.co.uk/media/2blh1b3n/gcse-adaptations-booklet-public-website-e-230920.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> https://gov.wales/young-people-not-education-employment-or-training-neet-april-2019-march-2020-html

Whilst we know Wales doesn't have control over the vast majority of vocational qualifications, they are none-the-less undertaken by students here in Wales. We have urged Welsh Government to work with colleagues across the border, colleges, accrediting bodies and Qualifications Wales, as appropriate, to ensure that the situation doesn't happen again next year. Fitness to practice qualifications must be appropriately amended to ensure that students enrolled on these courses are able to complete them in a safe way – including consideration on length of placements. Decisions and information is needed quickly on this, to ensure settings have the ability to plan and deliver any changes needed.

\* Is there anything additional that you would like the Committee to know at this stage, either in response to this document or as an update to the Committee?

NEU Cymru has raised the issues highlighted in our petition with Welsh Government and is represented on the WJEC Wales Advisory Group; the WG reference group on qualifications; and Teaching Unions and Representative Organisations (TURO) group.

## Agenda Item 2.5

P-05-1027 Allow Welsh domestic football clubs to play friendlies and allow supporters to attend matches

This petition was submitted by Callum Howen having collected a total of 2,045 signatures.

#### Text of Petition:

At the moment, only 'elite' athletes can play football matches in Wales. These games are being played behind closed doors, without spectators.

In England, clubs below the sixth tier are now admitting spectators at a reduced capacity to friendlies, In Scotland, fans are back at PRO14 matches.

Providing clubs meet the guidelines presented, they should be allowed to play friendlies with spectators.

#### Additional Information:

Last season, only Caernarfon Town had an average attendance of more than 500.

Please allow Welsh clubs to have crowds of 500

https://www.footballwebpages.co.uk/welsh-premier-league/attendances/2019-2020

#### Senedd Constituency and Region

- Ceredigion
- Mid and West Wales

# P-05-1027 - Allow Welsh domestic football clubs to play friendlies allow supporters to attend matches

Y Pwyllgor Deisebau | 13 Hydref 2020 Petitions Committee | 13 October 2020

Reference: RS20/\*\*\*\*\*

Petition Number: P-05-1027

Petition title: Allow Welsh domestic football clubs to play friendlies allow

supporters to attend matches

**Text of petition:** At the moment, only 'elite' athletes can play football matches in Wales. These games are being played behind closed doors, without spectators.

In England, clubs below the sixth tier are now admitting spectators at a reduced capacity to friendlies, In Scotland, fans are back at PRO14 matches.

Providing clubs meet the guidelines presented, they should be allowed to play friendlies with spectators.



## 1. Background

As the Welsh Government's letter responding to this petition states:

Organised outdoor activities, including team sports and classes, involving up to 30 people have been able to go ahead. On 3 August, some restrictions on the holding of sports events (including team sports and classes) outside were lifted. Now groups (all participants/competitors, ground staff and spectators who are there for the specific purpose of the event) of up to 30, from different households, are able to meet outside as long as they able to maintain social distancing rules. The Welsh Government's advice 'Sport, recreation and leisure: guidance for a phased return' provides general guidance on organised outdoor activities.

This Welsh Government clarifies that outdoor sports are able to take place even where social distancing is not possible:

outdoor gatherings are limited to 30 people, and all reasonable measures must be taken to maintain social distancing unless the gathering is an outdoor team sport.

#### 2. Welsh Government action

The Welsh Government has worked with Sport Wales - the national organisation responsible for developing and promoting sport and physical activity in Wales - to support sport through the pandemic.

Back in April, Sport Wales repurposed a total of £9 million - from Welsh Government, National Lottery and its own resources - to support sport and physical activity organisations during the pandemic. This package did not involve any new funding from the Welsh Government.

The first stage of this funding was a £550,000 Emergency Relief Fund for not-for-profit community sport.

The next phase was the Sport Resilience Fund, designed to help sports organisations operate in a world of coronavirus. This included the £4 million Be Active fund to support grassroots clubs and community organisations and £4.5

million to support larger organisations, such as sports governing bodies, local authorities and leisure trusts.

On 17 September the Welsh Government announced a £14 million **Sport and Leisure Recovery Fund**. The Welsh Government has said:

The sport and leisure recovery fund is designed to help provide essential support to sports clubs and organisations, independent providers and sporting events which have suffered a significant loss of revenue over recent months. The fund also makes available funding for innovation in local authority leisure centres and leisure trusts which complements funding available for increased costs and loss of income from the local government hardship fund.

The Deputy Minister recently told the Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee that this is new money which had not previously been allocated to the sector.

#### 3. Welsh Parliament action

The Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee published a report into the impact of the COVID-19 outbreak on sport.

The Committee heard that some of the sports that attract the largest crowds also attract significant broadcasting revenues, mitigating the impact of this lost match-day income. As Jonathan Ford from FAW told CWLC in June "at that top level, the economics work. The money from the TV markets in football is quite substantial, and the economics will allow that to survive".

Domestic and grassroots sport, by contrast, has a greater reliance on match-day income from box office and clubhouse takings. The FAW explained that there are "massive financial difficulties ahead" in this tier of sport, and that there would probably be "fewer clubs at the end of it".

The unequal impact of the crisis is not just one based on scale, but also gender. The FAW warned that recent growth in the female game "could be completely torn up on the back of this pandemic".

The Welsh Government accepted all the Committee's recommendations.

Every effort is made to ensure that the information contained in this briefing is correct at the time of publication. Readers should be aware that these briefings are not necessarily updated or otherwise amended to reflect subsequent changes.

Yr Arglwydd Elis-Thomas AS/MS Y Dirprwy Weinidog Diwylliant, Chwaraeon a Thwristiaeth Deputy Minister for Culture, Sport and Tourism



Ein cyf/Our ref DET/02211/20

Janet Finch-Saunders MS Chair Petitions Committee

Government.Committee.Business@gov.wales

18 September 2020

Dear Janet

Thank you for your correspondence of 4 September regarding petition P-05-1027.

We are sympathetic to the implications of the current restrictions upon sport venues. Organised outdoor activities, including team sports and classes, involving up to 30 people have been able to go ahead. On 3 August, some restrictions on the holding of sports events (including team sports and classes) outside were lifted. Now groups (all participants/competitors, ground staff and spectators who are there for the specific purpose of the event) of up to 30, from different households, are able to meet outside as long as they able to maintain social distancing rules. The Welsh Government's advice 'Sport, recreation and leisure: guidance for a phased return' provides general guidance on organised outdoor activities.

The situation regarding events is different. We are not yet at the stage where we can allow larger groups than 30 to get together in any one location for one specific purpose such as to watch a sports event or concert, due to the risks this poses, the difficulties of managing the crowds, and recording who is / was present. The First Minister announced recently that three test events in the sporting and cultural sector would take place. These have now taken place and involved working with a small number of partners to manage a series of events to be held outdoors but involving larger gatherings of no more than 100. The lessons learned from these test events are being considered within the review process, officials are also working closely with colleagues across the UK, under the auspices of the UK Events Co-ordination Group, to share information and best practice to further inform the review.

Yours sincerely,

1. Eli-17

Yr Arglwydd Elis-Thomas AS/MS

Y Dirprwy Weinidog Diwylliant, Chwaraeon a Thwristiaeth Deputy Minister for Culture, Sport and Tourism

Bae Caerdydd • Cardiff Bay Caerdydd • Cardiff CF99 1SN Canolfan Cyswllt Cyntaf / First Point of Contact Centre: 0300 0604400

<u>Gohebiaeth.Dafydd.Elis-Thomas@llyw.cymru</u>
Correspondence.Dafydd.Elis-Thomas@gov.wales

Rydym yn croesawu derbyn gohebiaeth yn Gymraeg. Byddwn yn ateb gohebiaeth a dderbynnir yn Gymraeg yn Gymraeg ac ni fydd gohebu yn Gymraeg yn arwain at oedi.

# P-05-1027 Allow Welsh domestic football clubs to play friendlies and allow supporters to attend matches, Correspondence – Petitioner to Committee, 06.10.20

First of all regarding the document, it doesn't address everything I am trying to fight for.

You say that it imposes a risk, but England have been allowing supporters into lower league games since the start of the season. What I hope you understand is, that Cymru Leagues clubs do not attract thousands of fans, the Cymru Premier usually attracts 200-400 fans max (with the exception of Caernarfon Town) whereas the Cymru North/South attract anywhere between 50-300. This is around how many spectators England currently allow into lower non-league games.

It would be easy to socially distance in football grounds in Wales, so why can't we try? Football is a release for many people, like an extended family. If you don't follow football then you won't understand how much it truly helps people both mentally and physically. People can go to football and even if it's just for 90 minutes they can forget all their troubles and can just have a good time with friends, As a government, you are denying people that opportunity, an opportunity for a release. An opportunity for people to just feel a sense of normality and happiness, for NINETY MINUTES A WEEK during these tough and scary times.

Clubs are also dying due to a lack of income and sponsorship, and this isn't helped by the Football Association of Wales, who I have reportedly seen are STILL taking registration fees from clubs, despite the fact they know that they aren't playing. Three examples of clubs that have gone bust are Rhyl, STM Sports and Plas Madoc. Rhyl - formerly one of the biggest teams in the Welsh pyramid. 2x Welsh Premier League champions, 2x Cymru Alliance champions, 4x Welsh Cup winners, 2x League Cup winners and former Champions League participants, gone after COVID-19 was the final nail in the coffin. STM Sports - finished sixth in the Cymru South last season and beat JD Cymru Premier sides Newtown and Aberystwyth. Relegated to the third tier due to licensing. Clubs are dropping like flies, and these three won't be the last if something isn't done.

At the start of the email I said that it doesn't address everything. Why can't tier 2 and below play? I am media officer at Cymru North side Penrhyncoch FC. We asked the Football Association of Wales if we could play Aberystwyth Town in a friendly about a month ago, a match both ourselves and Aberystwyth wanted to happen. The request was denied, but weeks later Aberystwyth hosted a friendly against MARKET DRAYTON TOWN from England. So us (Penrhyncoch FC), based FIFTEEN MINUTES away from Aberystwyth Town FC had a friendly denied, but Market Drayton Town based in Shropshire, two and a half hours away from Aberystwyth , were allowed to come down and play. I'm sorry, but how does that make any sense whatsoever? We have been given a provisional start date of October 19th for friendlies, but how can we be sure yourselves or the FAW won't change that? It's working in England so why can't we try it here? It's beyond ridiculous now.

So does it address the issues I have raised? No it doesn't if I'm honest.

Please, just consider my points. Not only are you damaging clubs, you're affecting people mentally and physically as well. For some people, football is one of the few aspects of happiness in people's lives, and you're taking it away from them. You are KILLING the Welsh football pyramid.

## Agenda Item 2.6

P-05-1028 Relax the excessive restrictions to allow motor sport rallies to take place in Wales

This petition was submitted by Jamie Edwards having collected a total of 3,889 signatures.

#### **Text of Petition:**

Car rallies taking place in Wales bring around £15 million into the Welsh economy each year. The impact of COVID-19 and the restrictions imposed on events has decimated the rally community in Wales – affecting jobs, businesses, careers and also having a major impact on rural communities across Wales who benefit from rally 'tourism'. The current restrictions mean it is impossible for organisers to plan ahead into 2021 – meaning many more events, businesses and jobs could be lost permanently.

### Additional Information:

Rallying has reacted to the COVID-19 impact and a trial event was held successfully in Cumbria in August. This involved competitors travelling from across the UK to attend an event in a private forest. The event was non-spectator, and strict social distancing guidelines were followed.

Pre-event administration was all completed electronically. There was zero physical interaction between course officials, marshals or timing teams and competitors through the use of digital technology.

There have been no reported cases of COVID-19 since the event ran, and the local area (Penrith) was boosted by hotel rooms being sold and restaurant tables booked.

Rallying in Wales is held in remote, rural parts of the communities, i.e. Dolgellau, Pembrey, Welshpool, Conwy, Neath Valley, Builth Wells. Social distancing can be followed, and events can be run to be as COVID-19 compliant as possible.

Currently, it is impossible to organise a motor rally in Wales due to the restrictions imposed.

## Senedd Constituency and Region

- Wrexham
- North Wales

Yr Arglwydd Elis-Thomas AS/MS Y Dirprwy Weinidog Diwylliant, Chwaraeon a Thwristiaeth Deputy Minister for Culture, Sport and Tourism



Ein cyf/Our ref DET/02212/20

Janet Finch-Saunders MS Chair Petitions Committee

Government.Committee.Business@gov.wales

23 September 2020

**Dear Janet** 

Thank you for your letter of 4 September regarding petition P-05-1028.

The coronavirus regulations allow outdoor gatherings that consist of no more than 30 people. We are not yet at the stage where we can routinely allow groups larger than 30 to gather together for a specific purpose, such as to watch or participate in a sports event or concert, due to the risks this poses, the difficulties of managing the crowds, and recording who is present. However, on 21 August the First Minister announced three small-scale outdoor events of up to 100 that would be trialled in Wales in the following weeks. The events, including a motorsport race at Trac Môn/Anglesey Circuit on Sunday, 6 September, are part of a phased approach to the safe reopening of the events industry. A copy of the statement can be found here.

These trials, alongside learning gathered from events being tested in other parts of the United Kingdom, will inform future reviews of the regulations. Officials are working closely with colleagues across the UK, under the auspices of the UK Events Co-ordination Group, to share information and best practice to further inform the review process.

Yours sincerely,

1. Chi- R

Yr Arglwydd Elis-Thomas AS/MS

Y Dirprwy Weinidog Diwylliant, Chwaraeon a Thwristiaeth Deputy Minister for Culture, Sport and Tourism

Bae Caerdydd • Cardiff Bay Caerdydd • Cardiff Canolfan Cyswllt Cyntaf / First Point of Contact Centre: 0300 0604400

<u>Gohebiaeth.Dafydd.Elis-Thomas@llyw.cymru</u>
Correspondence.Dafydd.Elis-Thomas@gov.wales

Rydym yn croesawu derbyn gohebiaeth yn Gymraeg. Byddwn yn ateb gohebiaeth a dderbynnir yn Gymraeg yn Gymraeg ac ni fydd gohebu yn Gymraeg yn arwain at oedi.

## P-05-1028 Relax the excessive restrictions to allow motor sport rallies to take place in Wales, Correspondence – Petitioner to Committee, 06.10.20

I think the main source of frustration that prompted the petition is that many other sports and pastimes are finding methods to re-engage back into the Welsh community – but motorsport in general has been virtually eliminated as a sport that people can be involved in. Welsh competitors are entering rallies in England and competing there where localised lockdowns don't apply.

We currently have a situation where rally events running in England are running as safely as possible, with the sport of rallying in particular having adapted new methods of running events to ensure minimal human contact.

Previously, the time keeping processes on rallies meant that competitor and marshals interacted, with time cards (used to keep track of event timing) being transferred by hand at different time controls.

The sport has eliminated that contact overnight since the pandemic began. Now, events use full electronic timing and results, and protocols have changed to allow competitors to remain in the vehicle, with marshals and timekeepers only present at time controls to help issues for safety reasons.

Please consider the following aspects of the current situation for a sport like rallying in Wales:

The sport takes place in solely rural areas. Events in England that have run since March have made them non-spectator – plus a limit on the number of people allowed to attend the event with each competing crew. This helps minimise the numbers of people present.

The Service Area (where the cars remain between competing on the special stages) are socially distanced – and mechanics and team personnel all wear masks. Social distancing is observed and a COVID-19 compliance officer monitors this at all times with regular inspections through the day, along with a briefing for all crews on the morning of the event.

The electronic timing and results processes mean that opportunities for direct contact have been removed.

Pre-event administrative checks (traditionally a face to face part of the process) are now all delivered electronically and confirmed before the event – again, reducing the need for people to congregate in an area. The event notice board is now electronic via an app or website – meaning (again), opportunities for people to congregate have been eradicated.

Pre-event car checks are now 'self-certified' – with a technical form completed prior to the event and socially distanced 'spot checks' by approved Motorsport UK authorised vehicle scrutineers completed at random on the day of the event to ensure compliance with the technical regulations.

Facilities for hand washing and hand sanitising are provided at each event for everyone to use.

It's hard to see how this can be better organised or safer in it's approach. The risk of transfer is managed and mitigated using this process. I compare this to something close to me that happened at the weekend. Wrexham AFC played a home game behind closed doors in the National League, but provided a live stream for fans to follow online. (Rallying would be doing the same for

spectators on events if they could run in Wales). However the public house attached to the ground, 'The Turf' sold tickets for fans to watch the game within the pub for the duration. There is absolutely no way that this was less than the 30 people as advertised – all within a close proximity of each other in a condensed area.

But......this is safe – as it was allowed to happen. Did anyone police it? No. Are they selling tickets again for future live screening? Yes. Are we seriously suggesting that a congregation of people from anywhere within Wrexham is fine – but a professionally managed event in a rural area away from the populace is 'too high risk?'. Really?

Compare to a test rally event that is trying to be planned for late in 2020 here in North Wales, north of Llyn Brenig on private forestry land. An event that would be strictly organised, enforced and self policed to ensure compliance in a remote area. There is no evidence to suggest that holding a rally in a confined outdoor location (the current proposals for test events are based within private forests with limited competitor numbers) causes a higher risk. An event held in a private forest in August in Cumbria was run to these proposals above along with track and trace processes implemented for all crews. No cases of COVID were linked to the event, nor was the track and trace follow up procedure required.

Whilst I fully recognise that there are challenges in Wales with local lockdowns, the principle of just putting a blanket ban on all kinds of recreational activity like this is grossly disproportionate to the levels of risk. If we are to learn to live with this virus as is being suggested – the sport can do no more than put these procedures in place in order to minimise the risk and the spread of transfer. It's easy to argue that I expose myself to more risk handling fresh fruit and vegetables in the supermarket than I would by competing on a car rally run to the above rules. I genuinely believe the level of risk is higher in the supermarket.

For clarity, what we are hopeful off in the short term is the opportunity to run closed to the public, smaller form, one day rallies run to the above protocols. These would be events held entirely within one venue (be that tarmac or forestry) where access can be strictly policed, regulated and monitored by the sport's governance body, Motorsport UK who have supported this principle. However, the only way to make such an event financially viable is to relax the restrictive number of a maximum of 30 people attending in total. If an exemption can be made for the National League, Welsh Premier League – I see no reason why a superbly organised sport like motorsport cannot be considered in this vein.

I thank you for the opportunity to hear my thoughts. As the Managing Director of Rally4Wales Contracts Limited, I run the company that repairs forest roads after rally use on the NRW estate. My role as founder and MD is entirely voluntary along with my co-directors. We have a full time female Ops Manager, plus all our sub-contractors are civil engineering companies based in rural Denbighshire, Llanwrst and Brecon. Those businesses, like ours, are struggling to survive financially, even with the financial support received on a grant basis from Welsh Government which we are thankful of.

The biggest frustration is that planning ahead for 2021 is nigh on impossible and there is a real risk that a business like R4W will fold. Events hopeful of running in February-May seem powerless to try and progress their event with so much uncertainty in place. Whilst we appreciate that it is a real challenge for Welsh Government to manage the pandemic – we also recognise that as an 'amateur' sport – we are one of the most highly regulated and professional sports when it comes to managing events. The risk assessments, method statements and safety principles that are in place for Wales

Rally GB (at World Rally Championship level) are replicated exactly on all small events in Wales – meaning safety is always of the highest priority for crews, organisers, volunteers and spectators.

We desperately need an opportunity to run small scale events in a safe and controlled environment to try and support the motorsport industry in Wales – be that small race events at Pembrey, rally events held entirely within the Epynt Ranges, or events in public or private forestry land that are non-spectator and professionally run to the above guidelines. Without any hope of this changing in the short to medium term future, there will be countless businesses that suffer the consequences and will not survive beyond the COVID restrictions regardless.

Diolch,

## Agenda Item 3

### P-05-886 Stop the Red Route (A55/A494 corridor)

This petition was submitted by Linda Scott having collected a total of 1,275 signatures online and 134 on paper, a total of 1,409 signatures.

### **Text of Petition**

We call on the National Assembly of Wales to urge the Welsh Government to withdraw its support for the "Red Route" (A55/A494/A548 Deeside Corridor Improvement) on the grounds that:

- 1) The construction of the new road through ancient woodland, and across agricultural land, contradicts Planning Policy Wales and the Well-being of Future Generations Act.
- 2) The recently published plans for a new A494 Dee Bridge, widening of the A494 and other improvements will deliver the Deeside traffic improvements without the need for the 'Red Route'.
- 3) The costs used to justify the choice of the "Red Route" failed to account for necessary upgrade of the Flintshire Bridge. It also does not include the addition of crawler lane at a major congestion point on the A55, the hill out of Northop towards Holywell. Congestion at these points will be made worse by the construction of the Red Route. The underestimate of the costs used imply that the proposed road cannot be considered value for money. Furthermore, the costs do not include the proposed A494 improvements (outlined in 2).
- 4) The choice of the Red Route was based on unrepresentative traffic surveys.
- 5) In considering the Red Route the Welsh Government failed to adequately consult residents of the Flint and Northop areas despite the major potential impact on their communities. Despite costing over a quarter of a billion pounds, the new road would be likely to lead to more traffic congestion in these communities.

6) The International Panel on Climate Change has called for urgent action to reduce C02 emissions, saying we have only 12 years left to save the world's climate. We need to be investing our limited resources in sustainable transport like rail.

## Senedd Constituency and Region

- Delyn
- North Wales

By virtue of paragraph(s) vi of Standing Order 17.42

Document is Restricted

## P-05-886 Stop the Red Route A55 A494 corridor - Correspondence from the petitioner to the Committee, 24.09.20

Many thanks for your response and the opportunity to reply. Since we last communicated we have been made aware of the enclosed recently published WAG briefing on the proposed new road, by a local AS, which has provided us with new incites from which we have derived the following questions to the minister:

### Question 1 (i)

On 13 December 2017, a new mandatory Transport Appraisal Guidance document was introduced (WelTAG2017). Just 78 days prior to that, on 26th September 2017, you announced that your preferred route was the Red Route.

The supplementary guidance to WelTAG 2017 says that, "When using WelTAG it is essential to comply with the duties set out in the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015."

Instead, the consultation response to the Route Options says that, this decision was based on the 2008 WelTAG. This pre-dates very important pieces of legislation,

including the Wellbeing of Future Generations Act 2015 and the Environment (Wales) Act 2016.

By taking the decision based on a version of the guidance from 2008, you failed to base that decision on an up-to-date and legally relevant framework, didn't you?

#### Question 1 (ii)

Similarly, by taking the decision based on the 2008 Framework, the decision was, in turn based on HM Treasury Green Book guidance dating from 2003.

You would agree, wouldn't you that the world has changed out of all recognition since then, so much so, that you had revised the WelTAG framework around the same time that the decision to support the Red Route was taken.

Your own WelTAG 2017 guidance requires "Schemes that are already being taken forward through the WelTAG 2008 should move over to WelTAG 2017 at an appropriate stage in their development".

No substantive or detailed design work has commenced nor spade put in the ground yet. Now would be an appropriate stage to assess the route against the principles set out in WelTAG 2017 wouldn't it?

#### Question 2

The Wales Transport Strategy has been commended for having a vision for a sustainable transport system for Wales. It will also be subject to plan stage Habitats Regulation Assessment and Strategic Environmental Assessment.

It would make sense, wouldn't it, for such a major and expensive piece of road infrastructure to be part of the broader transport for Wales strategy, which is (i) subject to the rigours of plan stage Habitats Regulations Assessment and Strategic Environmental Assessment and (ii) focused on delivering a more sustainable Wales?

#### Question 3

The Active Travel (Wales) Act 2013 requires Ministers to take account of and enhance Active Travel in the creation of new highways and alteration of existing highways. What specific Active Travel provisions are included in the Red Route budget to provide active travel enhancement linking the populations in Flint, Oakenholt, Connah's Quay and Shotton (population, 39,000) to the adjacent strategic economic growth area, Deeside Industrial Park (9000 jobs) over the Flintshire Bridge?

I should point out that the circulation of the this briefing 'behind the backs' of the petitioners has caused some annoyance, particularly amongst amongst those who stand to lose their homes and livelihoods! However we must stress that we realise that this is not the fault of the committee to whom we are very grateful in affording us the opportunity to be heard on this important matter.





Yn y Cynllun Cyllid Trafnidiaeth Cenedlaethol a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Gorffennaf 2015, datganodd Llywodraeth Cymru y byddem yn datblygu cynllun i wneud gwelliannau i goridor yr A55/A494/A548 yn Sir y Fflint, sy'n cael mwy o draffig na y cynlluniwyd ar ei gyfer a hynny'n arwain at dagfeydd cyson.

To mis Medi 2017, fe gyhoeddon ni yr opsiwn a ffefrir i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau hyn, wedi ystyried yn llawn agweddau technegol, cymdeithasol, enonomaidd ac amgylcheddol y cynllun ac wedi gwrando ar yr ymatebion i'r mgynghoriad.

rhan o'n rhaglen i gyflawni'r cynllun, mae angen i ni gynnal amryw o arolygon a chasglu data dros y misoedd nesaf i archwilio sut yn union y gellir pennu trywydd a chynllunio'r ffordd newydd mewn modd a fydd yn lleihau effaith y gwelliannau ar drigolion lleol, y dirwedd, ansawdd yr aer a bioamrywiaeth.

Amcan y nodyn briffio hwn yw ateb rhai o'r cwestiynau a all fod gennych am y cynllun a'r arolygon sydd i ddod.

The Welsh Government stated in the National Transport Finance Plan published in July 2015 that we would develop a scheme for improvements to the A55/A494/A548 Flintshire Corridor, which experiences more traffic than it was designed for, resulting in regular congestion.

In September 2017, we announced our preferred option to address these problems, having taken full account of the technical, social, economic and environmental aspects of the scheme and after listening to consultation responses.

As part of our programme to deliver the scheme we need to conduct a range of surveys and data gathering over the coming months to examine how exactly the new road can be routed and designed in a way that will minimise the impact of the improvements on local residents, the landscape, air quality and biodiversity.

This briefing note aims to answer some of the questions you may have about the scheme and the forthcoming surveys.



## Cefndir a chyd-destun polisi Background and policy context

Nod Llywodraeth Cymru yw creu cenedl fwy llewyrchus a chyfartal. Rydym wedi ymrwymo i weithio'n rhanbarthol er mwyn helpu i gyflawni hyn ac mae potensial enfawr i weld twf economaidd yng Ngogledd Cymru.

Mae system drafnidiaeth integredig fodern, aml-ddull, o ansawdd uchel, yn greiddiol i gyflawni'r potensial hwnnw, ynghyd â chyrraedd ein hamcanion o ran cynaliadwyedd a newid hinsawdd.

2017, amlinellodd Llywodraeth Cymru ein gweledigaeth ar gyfer y Metro Magneth Cymru. Mewn partneriaeth â Thrafnidiaeth Cymru a Chyngor Ymg y Fflint, mae system trafnidiaeth werdd yn cael ei chyflwyno yng Nglannau Dyfrdwy, un o'r ardaloedd cyflogaeth pwysicaf yng Nghymru. Bydd hyn yn cynnwys gwelliannau i rwydweithiau a gwasanaethau trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus yn ogystal â chyflwyno a gwella llwybrau teithio llesol.

Fodd bynnag, ni all trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus ar ei phen ei hun ddelio â'r galw presennol heb sôn am daclo'r tagfeydd pellach a ddisgwylir gan y twf mewn traffig yn y dyfodol.

Yn gyffredinol mae'r Coridor A55/A494/A548 Sir y Fflint islaw safonau dylunio modern. Mae gan rai o'r cyffyrdd slipffyrdd nad ydynt yn cydymffurfio â'r safonau presennol ar gyfer symud cerbydau yn ddiogel wrth gyrraedd a gadael yr A55 a'r A494.

The Welsh Government is striving for a more prosperous and equal nation. We are committed to working regionally to help achieve this and there is huge potential to deliver economic growth in North Wales.

A modern, high quality, multi-modal, integrated transport system is fundamental to achieving that potential, along with achieving our sustainability and climate change objectives.

In 2017, the Welsh Government set out our vision for the Metro in North Wales. In partnership with Transport for Wales and Flintshire County Council, a green transport system is being delivered in Deeside, one of the most important employment areas in Wales. This will include improvements to public transport networks and services as well as the introduction and enhancement of active travel paths.

However, public transport on its own cannot deal with current demand let alone tackle the further congestion expected from future growth in traffic.

The A55/A494/A548 Flintshire Corridor is generally below modern design standards, with some of the junctions having slip roads that do not comply with current standards for safe vehicle manouvering when entering and leaving the A55 and A494.



## Cefndir a chyd-destun polisi (par...) Background and policy context (cont...)

Dechreuodd y cam o roi cynllun ar waith i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau hyn ym mis Hydref 2020. Ers hynny, aseswyd coridor y ffordd drwy ddilyn y drefn Arweiniad ar Arfarnu Trafnidiaeth Cymru (WelTAG). Hyd yma cwblhawyd Camau 1 a 2 y Cynllunio a'r Arfarnu.

Nodwyd dau opsiwn, Coch a Glas, fel y rhai mwyaf addas i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau ac fel rhan o Gam 2 Arfarniad WelTAG, buom yn ymgynghori ar yr opsiynau hyn yng Ngwanwyn 2017, ynghyd ag opsiwn Gwneud Dim, lle laddai'r isadeiledd presennol yn cael ei gadw fel y mae.

dilyn ystyriaeth ofalus o'r holl astudiaethau a'r ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad, whoeddwyd ym mis Medi 2017 mai'r llwybr Coch oedd yr opsiwn a ffefrir.

The planning stage for a scheme to address these problems started in October 2010. Since then, the route corridor has been assessed using the Welsh Transport Planning Appraisal Guidance (WelTAG) procedure. The Planning and Appraisal Stages 1 and 2 have been completed to date.

Two options, Red and Blue, were identified as being most suitable for addressing the problems and as part of WelTAG Appraisal Stage 2, we consulted on these options in Spring 2017, along with a Do Nothing option, where the existing infrastructure would just be maintained as normal.

Following careful consideration of all studies and consultation responses, the Red route was announced as the preferred option in September 2017.









## Golwg sydyn ar gynllun Coridor Sir y Fflint The Flintshire Corridor scheme at a glance

Mae cynllun Coridor Sir y Fflint yn rhan annatod o Fetro Gogledd Cymru a bydd yn:

- **▽•** gwella gallu, dibynadwyedd ac amseroedd teithio
  - gwella diogelwch
  - gwella cysylltiadau busnes
- gwella mynediad rhwng ardaloedd preswyl a lleoliadau gwaith
- gostwng allyriadau carbon a lleihau'r effeithiau andwyol ar yr amgylchedd dynol ar hyd y ffyrdd presennol
- gwneud defnydd mwy effeithiol o'r isadeiledd trafnidiaeth sy'n bodoli'n barod
- cynnig cyfleoedd am well mynediad at drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus
- · cynnig cyfleoedd am ddulliau trafnidiaeth difodur a theithio llesol

The Flintshire Corridor scheme is an integral part of the North Wales Metro and will:

- improve capacity, reliability and journey times
- · improve safety
- improve connections for businesses
- improve access between residential areas and places of employment
- reduce carbon emissions and minimise adverse impacts on the human environment along the existing roads
- make more efficient use of the existing transport infrastructure
- provide opportunities for improved access to public transport
- provide opportunities for non-motorised modes of transport and active travel



### Mae'r llwybr a ffefrir yn cynnwys:

- Cerbytffordd ddeuol dwy lôn newydd sy'n 13km o hyd yn cysylltu Cyffordd Llaneurgain yr A55-A5119 (Cyffordd 33) â'r A494 a'r A550 i'r gogledd o Gyffordd Parkway Glannau Dyfrdwy, drwy Gyfnewidfa Celstryn a Phont Sir y Fflint
- Cyfuniad o wella'r ffordd bresennol, aliniad newydd a darn newydd o gerbytffordd
- Lle i fwy o gerbydau ar hyd yr A548 bresennol
  Addasu a gwella cyffyrdd
  - Darn newydd o ffordd rhwng yr A548 (yng Nghelstryn) a'r A55 (yn Llaneurgain)

## The preferred route comprises:

- A new 13km two-lane dual carriageway, linking the A55-A5119 Northop Junction (Junction 33) with the A494 and A550 north of Deeside Parkway Junction, via Kelsterton Interchange and the Flintshire Bridge
- A combination of improvement to the existing road, new alignment and a new length of highway
- Increased capacity along the existing A548
- Modifications and improvements to junctions
- A new section of road between the A548 (at Kelsterton) and the A55 (at Northop)





## Ble'r ydym ni nawr Where we are now

Ar hyn o bryd rydym ar Gam Allweddol 3. Yn ystod y cam hwn bydd y llwybr a ffefrir yn cael ei ddatblygu mewn mwy o fanylder a bydd arfarniadau amgylcheddol, traffig ac economaidd pellach yn cael eu gwneud. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi penodi'r cwmni rheolaeth fasnachol a syrfewyr meintiau siartredig, Corderoy, gyda chymorth Capita yn gynghorwyr technegol, i'n cynorthwyo i reoli cyflawni'r cynllun hwn.

Mae Corderoy wedi datblygu strategaeth gaffael i gyflawni'r cam nesaf. Fel an o'r strategaeth honno, caiff partner dylunio ei benodi yn gynnar yn 2021 i datblygu'r llwybr cyffredinol a drafodwyd yng Ngham Allweddol 2 yn gynnig mwl y gellir ei adeiladu.

Bydd y broses ddylunio gychwynnol hon yn ystyried yr holl faterion amgylcheddol a pheirianyddol yn fwy manwl a bydd yn ceisio taclo rhai o'r materion ychwanegol a godwyd yn ystod yr ymgynghoriad yn 2017. Er enghraifft, yn dilyn yr ymgynghoriad, mae'r Gweinidog Economi, Trafnidiaeth a Gogledd Cymru wedi cytuno i adolygu cyflwyno lôn ddringo ychwanegol ar yr A55, tua'r gorllewin o Gyffordd 33 yn Llaneurgain i Wasanaethau Helygain. Gwneir hyn drwy gomisiwn ar wahân gan Asiant Cefnffyrdd Gogledd a Chanolbarth Cymru (NMWTRA).

Un rhan allweddol o waith y tîm dylunio fydd ystyried yr ecoleg a'r bioamrywiaeth ar hyd y llwybr, ynghyd â nodweddion daearegol. Mae angen i ni felly gynnal ystod o arolygon yn 2020 i gasglu data tymhorol pwysig fel sail i ddylunio'r cynllun yn sensitif.

We are currently at Key Stage 3. During this stage the preferred route will be developed in further detail and further environmental, traffic and economic appraisals will be undertaken. The Welsh Government has appointed chartered quantity surveyors and commercial management practice Corderoy, supported by Capita as technical advisors, to assist us to manage the delivery of the scheme.

The team at Corderoy has developed a procurement strategy to deliver the next phase. As part of that strategy, a design partner will be appointed in early 2021 to develop the general route discussed at Key Stage 2 into a detailed, buildable proposal.

This preliminary design process will consider all the environmental and engineering issues in more detail and look to address some of the additional matters raised during the consultation in 2017. For example, following the consultation, the Minister for Economy, Transport and North Wales has agreed to review the introduction of an additional climbing lane on the A55, westbound from Junction 33 at Northop to Halkyn Services. This is being undertaken by a separate commission by North and Mid Wales Trunk Road Agent (NMWTRA).

A key part of the design team's work will be to consider the ecology and biodiversity along the route, along with geological characteristics. We therefore need to conduct a range of surveys during 2020 to gather important seasonal data to inform the sensitive design of the scheme.



# **Arolygon a'n hymrwymiad i dirfeddianwyr Surveys and our commitment to landowners**

Bydd ein tîm o Capita, yn gweithio ochr yn ochr ag Ymgynghoriaeth Gwynedd Consultancy (YGC), yn cynnal arolygon ecolegol er mwyn adnabod rhywogaethau a chynefinoedd pwysig a warchodir a all gael eu heffeithio ar hyd y llwybr a ffefrir yng nghynllun Coridor Sir y Fflint. Mae rhai o'r rhywogaethau a'r cynefinoedd hyn yn cael eu hamddiffyn hefyd o dan gyfraith y DU a chyfraith ryngwladol.

Defnyddir yr wybodaeth o ganlyniadau'r arolwg i ddylunio cynllun lle mae'r effeithiau ar fioamrywiaeth yr ardal yn cael eu lleihau neu eu hosgoi le bo modd. Bydd yr arolygon hefyd yn rhoi gwybodaeth ar welliannau argylcheddol addas y gellid eu gweithredu fel rhan o'r cynllun.

dechrau, dim ond archwiliadau amgylcheddol cychwynnol fydd yn digwydd, gyda nifer bychan o ecolegwyr yn cerdded dros y tir heb darfu arno er mwyn ahabod llefydd posibl y mae angen eu harolygu ymhellach.

Yn ystod Hydref 2020 byddwn yn cysylltu â thirfeddianwyr i ddechrau trafodaeth am gael mynediad ar eu tir i wneud yr arolygon hyn. Drwy weithio'n agos gyda thirfeddianwyr a'u tenantiaid, byddwn mewn gwell sefyllfa i drefnu unrhyw waith gan gadw'r amharu arnyn nhw i'r lleiaf posibl.

Gwneir pob ymdrech bosibl i osgoi unrhyw ddifrod a bydd tarfu'n cael ei gadw i'r lleiafswm. Ond, yn yr achosion prin yr achosir unrhyw ddifrod a/neu darfu gan y gwaith arolygu, gall iawndal fod yn daladwy ac mae hyn yn cynnwys ffioedd asiant rhesymol sy'n gysylltiedig â hawliadau o'r fath.

Our team from Capita, working alongside Ymgynghoriaeth Gwynedd Consultancy (YGC), will be undertaking ecological surveys in order to identify important and protected species and habitats that may be impacted along the preferred route of the Flintshire Corridor scheme. Some of these species and habitats are also protected under UK and international law.

The information from the survey results will be used to design a scheme where impacts on the biodiversity of the area are minimised or avoided where possible. The surveys will also provide information on appropriate environmental enhancements that could be implemented as part of the scheme.

In the first instance the surveys will involve preliminary environmental investigations only, with a small number of ecologists carrying out a non-invasive walkover of the land to identify potential areas of further survey.

During Autumn 2020 we will be contacting landowners to start a dialogue about gaining access to their land for these surveys. By working closely with landowners and their tenants we will be in a better position to arrange any work in a manner that causes the least amount of disruption to them.

Every possible effort will be made to avoid any damage and any disturbance will be kept to a minimum. However, in the rare occurrence that any damage and/or disturbance is caused by the survey work, compensation may be payable and this includes reasonable agents' fees relating to such claims.



## Casglu gwybodaeth a Covid-19 Information gathering and Covid-19

I fod yn ofalus ac ystyried iechyd y cyhoedd, bu'n rhaid i ni aildrefnu'n rhaglen er mwyn osgoi cynnal unrhyw arolygon yn hanner cyntaf 2020. Rydym bellach yn gwbl hyderus y gallwn gomisiynu a gwneud y gwaith arolygu mewn modd sy'n ddiogel i'r staff i gyd a'r gymuned leol.

dd pob un o'r gweithwyr yn gweithio yn unol â'r canllawiau a gyhoeddwyd dan reoliad 7A o Reoliadau Diogelu Iechyd (Cyfyngiadau Coronafeirws) (Cymru) 2020 ("Rheoliadau Coronafeirws") a byddant yn cymryd pob cam gesymol i gadw pellter cymdeithasol priodol rhwng y rheiny sydd yn y gweithle ar bob adeg.

Rydym hefyd wedi newid ein dull cyfathrebu. Fel arfer byddai'n swyddogion a'n partneriaid cyflawni prosiect yn ceisio cwrdd â chi wyneb yn wyneb, ond yn absenoldeb hynny rydym yn anfon y nodyn briffio hwn ac yn croesawu unrhyw geisiadau am gyfarfodydd dilynol ar y ffôn neu'n rhithiol, neu adborth mewn unrhyw ffurf.

In the interest of caution towards public safety, we rearranged our programme in order to avoid conducting any surveys in the first half of 2020. We are now fully confident that we can commission and carry out the survey work in a manner that is safe for all personnel and the local community.

All personnel will be working in accordance with the guidance issued under regulation 7A of the Health Protection (Coronavirus Restrictions) (Wales) Regulations 2020 (the "Coronavirus Regulations") and will take all reasonable measures to maintain an appropriate social distance between those in the workplace at all times.

We have also amended our communications activity. Whereas our officers and project delivery partners would usually aim to meet with you to provide a face-to-face briefing, we are sending you this briefing note and welcome any requests for follow-up phone or virtual meetings, or feedback in any format.



## Y camau nesaf Next steps

Mae'n bwysig i ni ein bod yn datblygu gwelliannau Coridor Sir y Fflint mewn trafodaeth agos â'r cymunedau lleol a'r rhanddeiliaid fel y gallwn gyflwyno'r buddiannau economaidd cysylltiedig yn y ffordd fwyaf priodol.

Byddwn yn cynnal digwyddiadau gwybodaeth i'r cyhoedd pan fyddwn wedi penodi partner dylunio a phan fydd hi'n addas ac yn ddiogel i ni wneud hynny, lle y gallwn gyfarfod y bobl leol, esbonio mwy am ein cynnydd hyd yma a gwrando ar unrhyw wybodaeth neu syniadau y gall fod gennych a allai'n haflpu ni a'n partner dylunio i ddatblygu'r llwybr a ffefrir ymhellach.

It is important to us that we develop the Flintshire Corridor improvements in close dialogue with local communities and stakeholders so that we can deliver the associated economic benefits in the most appropriate way.

We will be holding public information events when we have a design partner on board and when it is appropriate and safe to do so, where we can meet local people, explain more about our progress to date and listen to any information or ideas you may have that could help us and our design partner develop the preferred route further.





Mae mwy o wybodaeth, yn cynnwys lluniau o'r prosiect ac adroddiadau manwl am y cynllun hyd yma, ar gael ar wefan ein prosiect:

https://llyw.cymru/a55-a494-a548-coridor-sir-y-fflint-trosolwg

oes gennych unrhyw ymholiadau am gynnwys y nodyn hwn neu am y mllun yn gyffredinol, byddwn yn hapus iawn i drafod ymhellach gyda chi. Yn y le cyntaf, cysylltwch â:

Dwynwen Williams

Rheolwr Rhanddeiliaid, Corderoy

dwynwen.williams@corderoy.com | 07593 970803

Cysylltiadau pwysig eraill er gwybodaeth yw:

#### Sas Fernando

Peiriannydd Prosiect, Seilwaith yr Economi, Llywodraeth Cymru sasanka.fernando@gov.wales

### **Gary Mayo**

Rheolwr Prosiect, Corderoy gary.mayo@corderoy.com

Post: RHADBOST, Llywodraeth Cymru, Sarn Mynach, Cyffordd Llandudno, Conwy LL31 9RZ

More information, including project visuals and detailed reports on the scheme to date, are available on our project website:

https://gov.wales/a55-a494-a548-flintshire-corridor-overview

If you have any enquiries about the contents of this note or about the scheme in general, we would be very happy to discuss further with you. In the first instance please contact:

### **Dwynwen Williams**

Stakeholder Manager, Corderoy dwynwen.williams@corderoy.com | 07593 970803

Other important contacts for your reference are:

#### Sas Fernando

Project Engineer, Economic Infrastructure, Welsh Government sasanka.fernando@gov.wales

### **Gary Mayo**

Project Manager, Corderoy gary.mayo@corderoy.com

Post: FREEPOST, Welsh Government, Sarn Mynach, Llandudno Junction, Conwy LL31 9RZ

## Agenda Item 4.1

## P-05-1022 To follow the Scottish Parliament and have LGBTQ Welsh history taught in all Welsh schools

This petition was submitted by Natalie Bowen having collected a total of 116 signatures.

#### **Text of Petition:**

As someone who grew up under the shadow of Section 28 lack of LGBTQ+ education in schools has affected my entire life. It is unacceptable that the next generation of LGBTQ+ people should grow up this way. Wales has a rich and varied LGBTQ+ history and we believe that teaching this in schools will create a safer and more accepting environment for all.

### Additional Information:

Norena Shopland is the leading LGBTQ Welsh historian in the world. She has more than enough knowledge to be able to assist the government with this.

### Senedd Constituency and Region

- Rhondda
- South Wales Central

## **Teaching of LGBTQ History**

Y Pwyllgor Deisebau | 13 Hydref 2020 Petitions Committee | 13 October 2020

Reference: RS20/13898

Petition Number: P-05-1022

**Petition title**: To follow the Scottish Parliament and have LGBTQ Welsh history taught in all Welsh schools.

**Text of petition:** As someone who grew up under the shadow of Section 28 lack of LGBTQ+ education in schools has affected my entire life. It is unacceptable that the next generation of LGBTQ+ people should grow up this way. Wales has a rich and varied LGBTQ+ history and we believe that teaching this in schools will create a safer and more accepting environment for all.



## 1. Background

## 1.1. Current curriculum

The current National Curriculum for Wales comprises the core and foundation subjects which are set out in the Education Act 2002. The core subjects at Key Stages 2 and 3 are maths, English, science and in relation to Welsh speaking schools, Welsh. History is a foundation subject within the national curriculum. The Welsh Government's History Programme of Study (PDF 155KB) (January 2008) sets out the current requirements for history at Key Stages 2 and 3. Beyond Key Stage 3, the WJEC has published specifications for history at GCSE and AS/A level. These were introduced for first teaching in 2017 and 2015 respectively.

Delivery of PSE is a statutory requirement of the basic curriculum although content is at the discretion of schools. The non-statutory <u>Personal and social</u> <u>education framework for 7 to 19-year-olds in Wales</u> (2008) provides a recommended approach and learning outcomes. This includes that at Key Stage 4, learners should be given the opportunity to understand the range of sexual attitudes, relationships and behaviours in society.

Primary schools must provide sex education as contained within the national curriculum in Wales, (for example in the science subject order), but there is no requirement for primary schools to provide sex education as part of the basic curriculum. In secondary schools, and other educational settings that cater for learners of secondary school age, the basic curriculum must include provision for sex education for all registered pupils. The Welsh Government published guidance, Sex and relationships education in schools in 2010.

#### 1.1.a. New curriculum

Subject to the Senedd passing legislation, the new age 3-16 Curriculum for Wales will be introduced in all maintained schools and publicly funded nursery settings from September 2022 on a phased basis. The <u>Curriculum and Assesment (Wales)</u> <u>Bill</u> was introduced to the Senedd on 6 July 2020. The Bill sets out the four purposes of the curriculum:

- To enable pupils and children to develop as ambitious, capable learners, ready to learn throughout their lives;
- To enable pupils and children to develop as enterprising, creative contributors, ready to play a full part in life and work;

- To enable pupils and children to develop as ethical, informed citizens of Wales and the world:
- To enable pupils and children to develop as healthy, confident individuals, ready to live fulfilling lives as valued members of society.

The Welsh Government has emphasised that the new Curriculum for Wales will be **purpose-driven rather than content-driven**. Specific learning content is not stipulated in the same way as under the current national curriculum.

The Bill sets out six Areas of Learning and Experience (AoLEs) for the new curriculum and the mandatory elements within them. The AoLEs are:

- Expressive Arts
- Health and Well-being
- Humanities
- Languages, Literacy and Communication
- Mathematics and Numeracy
- Science and Technology.

The mandatory elements within the AoLEs will be English; Relationships and Sexuality Education; Religion, Values and Ethics and Welsh.

History will be taught within the <u>Humanities AoLE</u>. The Humanities AoLE also encompasses geography, religious education, business studies and social studies. The new curriculum is non-prescriptive and does not include a list of topics that all schools must teach.

The Bill provides for a 'What Matters Code' to set out key concepts of learning and experience in each AoLE (including Humanities) and that schools' curricula must encompass each of these concepts. The Welsh Government has published 'Statements of What Matters' in the <u>Curriculum for Wales documentation</u>. This is intended to provide the 'national approach' which the <u>Minister for Education says</u> will ensure consistency for learners.

The <u>provisional statutory guidance on the Humanities AoLE</u>, was published in January 2020.

## 1.2. Relationships and Sexuality Education

Following the review of the Expert Panel, chaired by Professor Emma Renold, the Minister announced in 2018 that the current requirement to teach sex education

in secondary schools would be extended to primary schools but that this be 'age-appropriate' and under the revised focus on 'Relationships and Sexuality Education'. The Welsh Government **consulted in February 2019** on draft guidance for schools on provision of RSE.

The draft guidance states that:

Inclusive RSE recognises the importance of diversity and difference across a range of identities related to relationships, sex, gender, sexuality and that this diversity is a source of strength and is foundational to a cohesive, fair and equitable society.

## 2. Position in Scotland

The Curriculum for Excellence (CfE) is the national curriculum in Scotalnd used from nursery to secondary school. It was implemented in 2010. It is similar in design to the new curriculum in Wales in that it is purpose rather than content driven. CfE is intended to foster four capacities in all young people:

- successful learners
- confident individuals
- responsible citizens
- effective contributors

Relationships, sexual health and parenthood is part of the <u>Health and Well-being</u> curriculum area.

On 19 April 2017, the Scottish Government set up the LGBTI Inclusive Education Working Group. The <u>Group's report</u> was published on 8 November 2018. Included in the Group's recommendations was that the Scottish Government should develop national guidance which clearly states expectations regarding LGBTI inclusive education. They also reccommended that the 2014 <u>Conduct of relationships, sexual health and parenthood education in schools Statutory</u> <u>Guidance</u> should be updated to use a 'thematic outcomes' based approach. The outcomes will cover various themes relating to LGBTI equality and inclusion, including:

- Understanding LGBTI terminology and identities;
- Representations of LGBTI people and their relationships in ways which seek to deliver understanding and equality;

- Recognising and understanding homophobia, biphobia, and transphobia within school and their impact on wider society;
- Tackling homophobia, biphobia, and transphobia within school and their impact on wider society;
- Understanding prejudice in relation to the LGBTI community and an awareness of the history of LGBTI equalities movements; and,
- An understanding of respect, privacy and consent.

The Scottish Government accepted all the recommendations. All state schools will be supported to teach LGBTI equality and inclusion across different age groups and subjects, grouped under various themes. The aim is for these recommendations to be delivered by the end of March 2021.

## 3. Position in England

In England, from September 2020, Relationships Education is compulsory in all primary schools; Relationships and Sex Education is compulsory in all secondary schools, and Health Education is compulsory in all state-funded schools. Due to the disruption caused by the COVID-19 pandemic, while the legal provisions came into force on 1 September 2020, schools may delay their introduction of the new requirements until summer 2021 if they are not ready to begin teaching the revised subjects.

The Departement for Education <u>guidance</u> (June 2019) states that schools are free to determine how they address LGBT specific content, but they expect:

all pupils to have been taught LGBT content at a timely point

and that:

At the point at which schools consider it appropriate to teach their pupils about LGBT, they should ensure that this content is fully integrated into their programmes of study for this area of the curriculum rather than delivered as a standalone unit or lesson.

Every effort is made to ensure that the information contained in this briefing is correct at the time of publication. Readers should be aware that

these briefings are not necessarily updated or otherwise amended to reflect subsequent changes.

Kirsty Williams AS/MS Y Gweinidog Addysg Minister for Education Llywodraeth Cymru

Welsh Government

Ein cyf/Our ref: KW/05197/20

Janet Finch-Saunders MS
Chair
Senedd Cymru Petitions Committee
Ty Hywel
Cardiff Bay
Cardiff
CF99 1NA

seneddpetitions@senedd.wales

14 September 2020

Dear Janet,

Thank you for your correspondence dated 4 September relating to Petition P-05-1022 - To Follow the Scottish Parliament and have LGBTQ history taught in all Welsh Schools.

It is important for learning to be inclusive and to draw on the experiences, perspectives and cultural heritage of contemporary Wales. The history of Wales is diverse, and comprises a variety of diverse and rich histories of the many communities, races, religions, and individuals in our country.

As you will be aware, in January 2020 the first iteration of the new Curriculum for Wales was launched. The curriculum will be available for first teaching in September 2022. At the heart of the new curriculum are the four purposes, which set out the aspirations for all children and young people. These four purposes, which specifically support learners to become "ethical, informed citizens of Wales and the World", are a part of the statutory framework for the Curriculum for Wales. Instilling learners with passion and pride in themselves, their communities and their country is a principal object of the four purposes. In the new curriculum, learners will explore the local, national and global contexts to all aspects of learning, and will learn how to make connections and develop understanding within a diverse society.

Central to the vision of the Curriculum for Wales is allowing teachers the flexibility to decide which topics, subjects and resources are best suited to their learners, and the framework encourages schools to build their own vision for their learners within the context of the four purposes and the learning defined at a national level. Whilst the new curriculum guidance does not include a long list of individual topics, it does set out what schools should take into account in designing their curriculum and the broad expectations for learners.

Canolfan Cyswllt Cyntaf / First Point of Contact Centre: 0300 0604400

Bae Caerdydd • Cardiff Bay Caerdydd • Cardiff CF99 1SN Gohebiaeth.Kirsty.Williams@llyw.cymru Correspondence.Kirsty.Williams@gov.wales

Rydym yn croesawu derbyn gohebiaeth yn Gymraeg. Byddwn yn ateb gohebiaeth a dderbynnir yn Gymraeg yn Gymraeg ac ni fydd gohebu yn Gymraeg yn arwain at oedi.

The Curriculum and Assessment Bill proposes that every school's curriculum must enable learners to progress towards these purposes. The Curriculum for Wales guidance forms part of the Curriculum for Wales Framework (Framework). The Framework is determined nationally and includes both the curriculum requirements, which will be set out in legislation, and a range of supporting guidance.

The Curriculum for Wales framework includes mandatory elements, including statements of What Matters for each Area of Learning and Experiences (AoLE). One of the statements of What Matters for Humanities, which includes History, is "Human societies are complex and diverse, and shaped by human actions and beliefs". Learners will explore how places, communities and societies evolve over time, experiencing continuity and change that has affected, and continues to affect, their own and other people's lives. This will help learners build an understanding of the causes, consequences and significance of the changes and interrelationships that have shaped societies at different levels of development.

Another statement of What Matters for Humanities is "informed, self-aware citizens engage with the challenges and opportunities that face humanity, and are able to take considered and ethical action". This aspect of the Area encourages learners to explore concepts including citizenship, authority and governance, interconnectedness, justice and equality, enterprise, rights and social action and responsibility.

The 'Designing Your Curriculum' guidance, published to support schools in implementing the Curriculum for Wales framework, explains that Wales, like any other society, is not a uniform entity, but encompasses a range of values, perspectives, cultures and histories that are inclusive of everyone who lives in Wales. The guidance also explicitly states that learning should "Focus on the experiences of ordinary people, including those who have traditionally been underrepresented."

Learners should be grounded in an understanding of the identities, landscapes and histories that come together to form their *cynefin*. This will not only allow them to develop a strong sense of their own identity and well-being, but to develop an understanding of others' identities and make connections with people, places and histories elsewhere in Wales and across the world. The guidance explicitly states the importance of learning being inclusive and drawing on the experiences, perspectives and cultural heritage of contemporary Wales.

Learning about human rights, equity, and diversity are cross-cutting themes which should be embedded within learning across the curriculum. The guidance on <a href="cross-cutting themes">cross-cutting themes</a> for the curriculum explains how schools and practitioners should have a methodology for designing a curriculum which incorporates, where appropriate, opportunities which allow learners to consider local, national and international contexts and to develop understanding of relationships and sexuality education, human rights education and diversity, and careers and work-related experiences.

Safeguarding all our young people and supporting them to navigate the complex area of Relationships and Sexuality Education (RSE) is vital. This is why we are making RSE a statutory requirement in the new curriculum. Within the new curriculum, inclusivity is a key principle that underpins our vision for RSE. Learners will also be given a broader understanding of sexuality that is fully inclusive of LGBTQ+ learners which includes wider issues such as rights, equity and respecting diversity that draws on all Areas of learning and experience, including Humanities.

Earlier this year I established a RSE Working Group to agree the topics to be covered by schools and to co-construct the detailed guidance to support learning. The role of the group

is to engage in the development of RSE guidance, and to develop a shared understanding of the new curriculum.

One of the core themes which the Black, Asian and Minority Ethnicities Communities, Contributions and Cynefin in the New Curriculum Working Group will be exploring is the principle of Cynefin. Cynefin is a principle within the <u>Curriculum for Wales</u> framework and its guidance. It is defined as our place of belonging, but not just the physical place, it includes the different histories, cultures, social aspects, language, and community. Cynefin is described as "The place where we feel we belong, where the people and landscape around us are familiar, and the sights and sounds are reassuringly recognisable. Though often translated as 'habitat', cynefin is not just a place in a physical or geographical sense: it is the historic, cultural and social place which has shaped and continues to shape the community which inhabits it."

This will be different for all individuals, and naturally must extend to LGBTQ+ history, as it will be essential for all learners, as it provides an opportunity that learning in the Curriculum for Wales is meaningful and recognisable, and helps cultivate in learners a sense of place and sense of belonging. The work of the Group will be closely aligned to the Estyn review of Welsh history will be carried out in phases. The first phase will focus on a review of existing resources available to teachers and good practice, and the second phase will focus on a review of professional learning related to BAME communities. This phased approach will allow us to feed into teaching for the coming academic year and before the Group is hopefully in a position to present key recommendations to me by the end of December.

In order to deliver the new curriculum effectively and realise our shared vision, it is vital that our schools have the support, understanding and resources they need. We will therefore be working with practitioners to commission new resources which will refer to key events and topics in the histories of Wales and the world. This work will also be informed by the outcome of the forthcoming Estyn review of Welsh history, which will take full account of Welsh and wider history, identity and culture.

Yours sincerely

Kirsty Williams AS/MS Y Gweinidog Addysg

Minister for Education

# P-05-1022 To follow the Scottish Parliament and have LGBTQ Welsh history taught in all Welsh schools, Correspondence – Petitioner to Committee, 05.10.20

We as a team have reviewed the attached document. We feel it covers off most points. However, we believe that to truly be inclusive in our education we must have a historical context taught as well as LGBTQ+ education. Some of the biggest things to happen in LGBTQ+ history happened in Wales. From the Ladies of Llangollen being the first documented "lesbians" to the Welsh coalminers travelling to London to join protests against section 28 etc.. there is a rich history of Welsh LGBTQ+ history which needs to be taught. It would help any relationship led educate to bring historical context to it. We will be happy to discuss further or answer any specific questions via email. Please let me know if this is a virtual debate or if our team can attend.

Diolch.

## Agenda Item 4.2

# P-05-1023 Welsh Government funding for recycling bins and collections in all education settings in Wales

This petition was submitted by Kathryn Davids having collected a total of 81 signatures.

#### Text of Petition:

Presently, councils in Wales charge schools to collect recyclable waste. With limited annual funding this is a cost that schools find difficult to meet. As a result, a huge amount of recyclable waste is going into landfill as recycling bins and collection are not provided.

In April 2019, the Welsh Government declared a climate emergency, yet teachers and learners are not able to contribute to reducing their carbon emissions in their place of work or learning. Many teachers take recycling from their classrooms to recycle at home, or Eco Clubs in schools collect waste, but there needs to be consistency nationally, so that recycling becomes a habit at home and at school.

I am calling for Welsh Government to provide funding to enable this to happen across the country, to really show their motto of being a small country with big ambition.

#### Additional Information:

It is a complete paradox that we are educating pupils to live more sustainably and be more environmentally conscious, but in the very places they learn about these issues, they cannot carry out these actions.

The Successful Futures Curriculum aims for all learners to be ethical and informed citizens of Wales and the World. Recycling should be achievable in all schools as part of being an ethical citizen, especially in a country that ranks second in the world for recycling household waste.

Recycling in all schools has to be an integral part of the Welsh Government's aim to be zero waste by 2050 and be part of the Low Carbon Plan for Wales.

This has to be about more than just personal responsibility and about enabling and empowering our young people to act and make positive choices and, for educators and all who work in schools to be able to follow through on the messages they are giving to our young people.

## Senedd Constituency and Region

- Pontypridd
- South Wales Central

Petition Number: P-05-1023

Petition title: Welsh Government funding for recycling bins and collections in

all education settings in Wales

## Text of petition:

Presently, councils in Wales charge schools to collect recyclable waste. With limited annual funding this is a cost that schools find difficult to meet. As a result, a huge amount of recyclable waste is going into landfill as recycling bins and collection are not provided.

In April 2019, the Welsh Government declared a climate emergency, yet teachers and learners are not able to contribute to reducing their carbon emissions in their place of work or learning. Many teachers take recycling from their classrooms to recycle at home, or Eco Clubs in schools collect waste, but there needs to be consistency nationally, so that recycling becomes a habit at home and at school.

I am calling for Welsh Government to provide funding to enable this to happen across the country, to really show their motto of being a small country with big ambition.

It is a complete paradox that we are educating pupils to live more sustainably and be more environmentally conscious, but in the very places they learn about these issues, they cannot carry out these actions.

The Successful Futures Curriculum aims for all learners to be ethical and informed citizens of Wales and the World. Recycling should be achievable in all schools as part of being an ethical citizen, especially in a country that ranks second in the world for recycling household waste.

Recycling in all schools has to be an integral part of the Welsh Government's aim to be zero waste by 2050 and be part of the Low Carbon Plan for Wales.

This has to be about more than just personal responsibility and about enabling and empowering our young people to act and make positive choices and, for educators and all who work in schools to be able to follow through on the messages they are giving to our young people.

## 1. Background

Under the <u>Controlled Waste (England and Wales) Regulations 2012</u> local authorities have the power to charge for waste collection and dispsoal from non-domestic premises. Such premises include universties, schools and other educational establishments. It is therefore at the discretion of local authorities

whether to charge for waste collection and disposal from schools. It is up to schools as to whether they choose to procure their waste collection services from the local authority or from a commercial provider.

Prior to the 2012 regulations, all local authorities were obligated to collect waste from these premises when requested, but could only charge for collection, not disposal. The changes came into effect following a joint consultation on the previous controlled waste regulations in November 2010 by the UK Department of Food, Environment and Rural Affairs (DEFRA) and the then Welsh Assembly Government. The proposals enabled local authorities to make a charge for waste collection and disposal to establishements listed under Schedule 2 of the Controlled Waste Regulations 1992, including schools. The joint government response to the consultation was published in March 2012. It stated:

...our proposals to allow local authorities the power to charge educational establishments for their waste disposal received near unanimous support from respondents. As a result, we intend to legislate to treat educational establishments as commercial waste.

## 2. Welsh Government action

The Welsh Government published its <u>Towards Zero Waste</u> strategy in 2010. The strategy set out the approach the Welsh Government would take to reach its target of Wales being a zero waste country by 2050. More recently, the Welsh Government has consulted on its new circular economy strategy, <u>Beyond Recycling</u>. However, neither of these strategies specifically address the issue of recycling (or waste) collections from schools and other educational establishments.

In April 2019, the Deputy Minister for Housing and Local Government, Hannah Blythyn MS, launched a £6.5m Circular Economy Fund for local authorities and publicly funded bodies in Wales. Under the scheme, grants of up to £500,000 have been offered to publicly funded bodies to adapt their processes and to transition to a circular economy. The Minister's letter states that:

£3.7 million of funding has been allocated to date to 34 projects. In total 91 applications have been received for the second round of the Circular Economy Fund, including applications from various schools and universities. The benefits realised across the 34 projects supported to date include; improved recycling rates; improved quality of recyclates;

reduced single use plastics; revenue efficiency savings for local authorities; and reduced vehicle movements therefore reduced emissions of carbon and pollutant.

The Minister says that the petition highlights the issue of the costs of recycling and where those costs fall. She refers to work that the Welsh Government is currently undertaking on Extended Producer Responsibility (EPR) as part of the UK *Environment Bill 2019-21*. EPR aims to ensure that producers bear the cost of disposal of products that they place onto the market, in line with the "polluter pays" principle. The proposed EPR scheme will make producers responsible for the full net costs for their waste management activities once the packaging has been used. More information on EPR can be found in a recent <u>Senedd Research blog post on the UK Environment Bill</u>. The letter states that a consultation on the detailed design of the scheme is planned for 2021.

## 3. Welsh Parliament action

The issue of waste and recycling collections from schools has not been considered in the Senedd.

Every effort is made to ensure that the information contained in this briefing is correct at the time of publication. Readers should be aware that these briefings are not necessarily updated or otherwise amended to reflect subsequent changes.

Hannah Blythyn AS/MS Y Dirprwy Weinidog Tai a Llywodraeth Leol Deputy Minister for Housing and Local Government



Eich cyf/Your ref P-05-1023 Ein cyf/Our ref HB/00583/20

Janet Finch-Saunders MS Chair, Petitions Committee

24 September 2020

Dear Janet Finch-Saunders MS,

Thank you for your letter of 4 September in relation to recycling at education settings in Wales. Our aim is to move to a circular economy in Wales, where waste is avoided and the things we use are kept in use as long as possible. This is an important part of the action needed on climate change and brings many new opportunities as part of the move to a low carbon economy.

As a Government, we are working to apply the approach that has been so successful for the recycling of household waste in Wales to non-domestic waste, including the material generated in schools. The aim is to increase the amount of materials recycled from businesses and other non-domestic organisations, not only to deliver key environmental benefits but also in order to improve the quality of materials available and to ensure that the materials that can be recycled aren't wasted.

In order to support schools and other publicly funded bodies to prepare, a £6.5m Circular Economy Fund for local authorities and publicly funded bodies was launched alongside the consultation on the Circular Economy Strategy, Beyond Recycling, in December 2019 to support this and other actions within the strategy. The results of this consultation can be found online at https://gov.wales/circular-economy-strategy.

Grants of up to £500,000 have been offered in recognition of the importance of supporting publicly funded bodies such as schools and universities to adapt their processes and to transition to a circular economy driving further increases in recycling and decarbonisation. In the first of two rounds 82 applications were received totalling £12m representing a breadth of projects from a wide range of organisations including local authorities, universities, schools, colleges and the NHS.

Canolfan Cyswllt Cyntaf / First Point of Contact Centre: 0300 0604400

Bae Caerdydd • Cardiff Bay Caerdydd • Cardiff CF99 1SN  $\underline{ Gohebiaeth. Hannah. Blythyn@llyw.cymru} \\ \underline{ Correspondence. Hannah. Blythyn@gov. wales}$ 

Rydym yn croesawu derbyn gohebiaeth yn Gymraeg. Byddwn yn ateb gohebiaeth a dderbynnir yn Gymraeg yn Gymraeg ac ni fydd gohebu yn Gymraeg yn arwain at oedi.

We welcome receiving correspondence in Welsh. Any correspondence decived in Welsh will be answered in Welsh and corresponding in Welsh will not lead to a delay in responding.

£3.7million of funding has been allocated to date to 34 projects. In total 91 applications have been received for the second round of the Circular Economy Fund, including applications from numerous schools and universities. The benefits realised across the 34 projects supported to date include; improved recycling rates; improved quality of recyclates; reduced single use plastics; revenue efficiency savings for local authorities; and reduced vehicle movements therefore reduced emissions of carbon and pollutant.

The petition highlights the issue of the costs of recycling and where those costs fall. We are currently working in partnership with the other governments in the UK to introduce an Extended Producer Responsibility Scheme (EPR). EPR's ensure that producers bear the cost of disposal of the products they place onto the market. This is in line with the 'polluter pays' principle.

The scheme will make producers who place packaging on to the market responsible for paying the full net costs for the waste management activities once the packaging has been used.

This will cover the costs for collection and handling of packaging and costs for the clear up of packaging that is littered or fly tipped. As well as this, the fees producers pay will be designed to incentivise packaging design to ensure it is easy to recycle. Currently in the UK it is estimated that producers pay approximately 10% of the overall costs of recycling their packaging waste. EPR proposals will shift this to 100% and a consultation of the detailed design of the scheme is planned for next year.

Yours sincerely,

Hannah Blythyn AS/MS

Hannah Blytun

Y Dirprwy Weinidog Tai a Llywodraeth Leol Deputy Minister for Housing and Local Government

# P-05-1023 Welsh Government funding for recycling bins and collections in all education settings in Wales, Correspondence – Petitioner to Committee, 04.10.20

• What are your thoughts on the attached document?

I found this very informative. It is fantastic to hear that there has been some progress and funding made available towards Wales' aim to become a circular economy. It is also pleasing to hear that the emphasis will be placed on the producers to cover the costs of recycling their packaging.

- Does it adequately address the issues that you raised?
   This does address the issues I raised in my petition.
- Do you have further questions in response?
   Was the uptake for the Circular Economy Fund as you'd hoped?
   Will the funding increase to roll out the Circular Economy Fund to more institutions?
   (34 projects is a small fraction of the over 1,500 schools there are in Wales)
- Is there anything additional that you would like the Committee to know at this stage, either in response to this document or as an update to the Committee?
   No

## Agenda Item 4.3

## P-05-1026 Petition to ban the snaring of wildlife for use in the fur trade

This petition was submitted by National Anti Snaring Campaign having collected a total of 2,481 signatures.

### **Text of Petition:**

While fur farming was banned in the UK in 2000, fur trapping is still legal for certain wild animals such as foxes, rabbits and mink.

We are campaigning to close this loophole to prevent more animals suffering in these barbaric traps, being killed inhumanely and skinned for their pelts.

We request that all snaring of wild animals for use in the fur trade be abolished and for this law to be upheld by the appropriate authorities and monitored closely.

#### Additional Information:

This petition has been created in reference to the recent incident which has come to light of a Welsh fur trapper blatantly and deliberately snaring foxes, beating them to death and skinning them in order to sell their pelts in the foreign fur trade.

## Senedd Constituency and Region

- Clwyd South
- North Wales

# P-05-1026 Petition to ban the snaring of wildlife for use in the fur trade

Y Pwyllgor Deisebau | 13 Hydref 2020 Petitions Committee | 13 October 2020

Reference: RS20/13589-1

Petition Number: P-05-1026

Petition title: Petition to ban the snaring of wildlife for use in the fur trade.

Text of petition: While fur farming was banned in the UK in 2000, fur trapping

is still legal for certain wild animals such as foxes, rabbits and mink.

We are campaigning to close this loophole to prevent more animals suffering in these barbaric traps, being killed inhumanely and skinned for their pelts.

We request that all snaring of wild animals for use in the fur trade be abolished and for this law to be upheld by the appropriate authorities and monitored closely.



## 1. Background

## The use of snares

Snaring involves trapping and restraining an animal, often prior to it being killed. It is predominantly used in the UK by farmers and other land managers to control wildlife such as foxes, rabbits, rats, grey squirrels and mink. It is also used legally by some to catch wildlife for its fur.

Under the Wildlife and Countryside Act 1981 it is an offence to:

- set a self-locking snare in such a way as to be calculated to cause bodily injury to any wild animal;
- kill or take any wild animal using a self-locking snare;
- set a snare (or other article) in such a way as to be calculated to cause bodily injury to any animal listed in Schedule 6 of the Act, for example badgers;
- kill or take any animal listed in Schedule 6 of the Act using a snare;
- set a snare and then fail to inspect that snare (or have someone else inspect it) at least once every day;
- set any type of snare unless they are an 'authorised person' under the Act (that is, the owner or occupier of the land on which the snare is set, any person authorised by the owner or occupier of the land, or a person authorised in writing by the Local Authority for the area); and
- possess a snare for the purpose of committing any of the above offences.

Section 11(4) of the *Wildlife and Countryside Act 1981* gives the Welsh Ministers limited powers to amend the regulation of snare use, but only for the "purpose of complying with an international obligation". For any other amendments, changes to primary legislation are needed.

Under Section 9 of the <u>Animal Welfare Act 2006</u>, individuals must take reasonable steps to ensure that the welfare needs of all animals under their control are met, and that the animal is protected from pain and suffering.

Section 14 of the *Animal Welfare Act 2006* makes provision for the Welsh Ministers to publish codes of practice. In 2015, the Welsh Government published the <u>Code of best practice on the use of snares in fox control</u> (detailed below in 'Welsh Government action').

The <u>Deer Act 1991</u> prohibits the use of snares to capture, kill or cause bodily harm to deer (Section 4).

The Wild Mammals Protection Act 1996 prohibits violent acts with intent to inflict unnecessary suffering on wild mammals (Section 1).

These are currently no legislative controls in place on the manufacture and sale of snares.

## The fur trade

The *Fur Farming (Prohibition) Act 2000* 'prohibits the keeping of animals solely or primarily for slaughter for the value of their fur' in England and Wales.

Whilst fur farming is banned, it is legal in the UK to import and export fur from a range of species such as fox, rabbit and mink. Snaring of animals for pelts is legal, whilst adhering to certain legislation, see above.

The Welsh Government <u>has referred</u> to banning the sale and import of real animal fur as a complex matter which includes devolved and non-devolved powers.

## 2. Welsh Government action

## The use of snares

Code of best practice on the use of snares in fox control

On 25 September 2015, the Welsh Government published a 'Code of best practice on the use of snares in fox control' (a statutory code under the Animal Welfare Act 2006). The code summarises the current legal obligations on those using snares and sets out best practice guidelines that should be followed. The code states: 'the purpose of the snare is to hold the fox and avoid causing unnecessary suffering whilst the fox is held, until it can be killed humanely.' It is focused on controlling foxes in rural areas rather than trapping for pelts.

Failure to comply with such a code is not an offence in itself. However, failure to comply with a relevant provision of a code of practice may be relied upon by a court as tending to establish liability.

In April 2019, the Welsh Government published a <u>report on the 2015 code</u> following a recommendation from the Senedd's Climate Change, Environment

and Rural Affairs (CCERA) Committee that annual reports be published on the code (see 'Welsh Parliament action').

The 2019 report detailed a February 2018 stakeholder event on the code. It stated that a 'wide range of stakeholders attended the event, with differing views on the use of snares'. It said:

Stakeholders confirmed the Code has been widely disseminated to their members who use snares as part of their day to day job. These stakeholders believe their members are complying with the recommendations of the Code. However, there is little empirical evidence and it is acknowledged that it is difficult to quantify or evidence good practice and compliance with the Code as the setting and using of snares mostly takes place on private land.

The next steps detailed in the 2019 report included that Welsh Government officials were to meet with stakeholders again in May 2019. Evidence gathered would then be used as part of the ongoing process to determine if the 2015 code 'is working or not and whether further measures including legislative options need to be considered'. The Research Service has been unable to find any public information on the planned May 2019 event.

Taking forward Wales' sustainable management of natural resources consultation

The Welsh Government's 2017 consultation, <u>Taking forward Wales' sustainable</u> <u>management of natural resources</u>, sought views on the regulation of snares (Chapter 10). It included seven proposals covering aspects of snare design and snare operator practice asking whether there should be further Order making powers for the Welsh Ministers to regulate snares.

In the 2017 consultation, the Welsh Government referred to the use of snares in the context of pest control, but did not refer to use of snares for the fur trade:

Snares should remain available to land managers as a legal method of dealing with pest species and the use of snares must be subject to robust safeguards.

A large proportion of the respondents to the 2017 consultation opposed the use of snares in general and felt they should be completely banned.

The Welsh Government concluded that the banning of snares was not a proposal set out in the consultation, so a complete picture of peoples' views on a ban on

snares, either positive or negative, could not truly be obtained through this consultation.

There have been no further steps taken on regulation of snare use since the 2017 consultation.

## The Agriculture (Wales) Bill

The letter from the Minister for Environment, Energy and Rural Affairs, Lesley Griffiths MS, (hereafter 'the Minister'), responding to this petition, states that she will publish a White Paper for the anticipated Agriculture (Wales) Bill, this year. The Bill is expected during the Sixth Senedd. She intends the Bill to provide the legislative powers to 'regulate all aspects of the sale and use of snares in Wales'.

## 3. Welsh Parliament action

## The use of snares

In 2016/17 the CCERA Committee carried out an inquiry into the use of snares. In June 2017 the Committee published its 'Report on the use of snares in Wales'. It concluded:

This inquiry has shown us that there are considerable gaps in the data available to understand the scale, efficacy, and humaneness of snare-use in Wales.

We have set out recommendations that aim to establish a framework for obtaining the requisite data and to apply this data to a review of current policy.

If the efficacy and humaneness of this approach can be demonstrated through the data, then we have recommended that the Welsh Government keeps its approach under regular review. If not, then the Welsh Government must be in a position to act swiftly. [...] We have recommended that the Welsh Government prepares draft legislation now so that it is in a position to act immediately should the combined efforts of government, the industry and landowners fail to deliver the ambitions of the Code.

The Committee recommended the Welsh Government should undertake annual reviews of the 2015 code and publish a report of that review. As discussed, the

Welsh Government's annual report on the 2015 code of practice was published in April 2019.

## The fur trade

This Committee is also considering the petition P-05-901 Ban the Sale of Real Fur in Wales which condemns the trapping of wild animals for fur.

The Committee received a letter (August 2019) from the British Fur Trade Association, in relation to the P-05-901 petition. The letter set out the role of the fur trade in driving up animal welfare standards in the UK and internationally, and highlights that implementing a ban would threaten these standards. It said that the industry would shortly launch and roll out **FURMARK**, an international mark intended to guarantee standards in these areas across the supply chain, including at the point of sale.

In a letter (October 2019) to the Committee on the P-05-901 petition, the Minister said that any legislation in this area is heavily dependent on the UK's future relationship with the EU. She set out the Welsh Government's position on the issue:

> We currently support the UK Government's position which states while some fur products may never be legally imported into the UK, national bans are less effective than working at an international level on animal welfare standards

The Minister outlined international efforts to bring about higher standards, supported by EU rules and regulations around the fur trade. She concluded by saying that the UK Government has previously stated it will ensure these controls are not removed once the UK leaves the EU.

In February 2017, Paul Davies MS asked the (then) Cabinet Secretary for Environment and Rural Affairs, Lesley Griffiths AM, to make a statement on the Welsh Government's position in relation to the selling of animal furs in Wales. In response, the then Cabinet Secretary said:

> Fur Farming was banned by the UK Government in England and Wales on ethical grounds in 2000. The Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora (CITES) regulates the import, re-export, sale or movement of endangered wild animals or their parts and aims to ensure international trade in wild animals species does not threaten their survival.

Every effort is made to ensure that the information contained in this briefing is correct at the time of publication. Readers should be aware that these briefings are not necessarily updated or otherwise amended to reflect subsequent changes.

Lesley Griffiths AS/MS Gweinidog yr Amgylchedd, Ynni a Materion Gwledig Minister for Environment, Energy and Rural Affairs



Eich cyf/Your ref P-05-1026 Ein cyf/Our ref LG/02221/20

Janet Finch-Saunders MS Chair – Petitions Committee

Government.Committee.Business@gov.wales

24th September 2020

**Dear Janet Finch-Saunders** 

Thank you for your letter of 4 September, regarding the petition you have received from the National Anti-Snaring Campaign who are requesting a ban on the snaring of wildlife for use in the fur trade.

The Welsh Government controls the use of snares through the legal restrictions contained principally in the Wildlife and Countryside Act 1981, the Animal Welfare Act 2006, Wild Mammal Protection Act 1996 and the Deer Act 1991. These is currently no legislative controls in place on the manufacture and sale of snares.

The Animal Welfare Act 2006 makes provision for the issuing of codes of practice for the welfare needs of animals. Failure to comply with such a code is not an offence in itself. However, failure to comply with a relevant provision of a code of practice may be relied upon by a court as tending to establish liability.

In 2015, the Welsh Government introduced a new <u>Code of Best Practice on the Use of Snares in Fox Control</u> under Section 14 of the Animal Welfare Act 2006. In drawing up the Code officials worked and continue to work with stakeholders which supported the continued use (agriculture and gamekeeper interest groups) and those which would like to ban all snare use (animal welfare groups). Regulators such as Natural Resources Wales and the Police have also being included in ongoing stakeholder meetings. As I have previously said if this voluntary approach fail to drive up operator practice and animal welfare standards I would seek to regulate the sale and use of snares in Wales.

Bae Caerdydd • Cardiff Bay Caerdydd • Cardiff CF99 1SN Canolfan Cyswllt Cyntaf / First Point of Contact Centre: 0300 0604400

<u>Gohebiaeth.Lesley.Griffiths@llyw.cymru</u>
Correspondence.Lesley.Griffiths@gov.wales

Rydym yn croesawu derbyn gohebiaeth yn Gymraeg. Byddwn yn ateb gohebiaeth a dderbynnir yn Gymraeg yn Gymraeg ac ni fydd gohebu yn Gymraeg yn arwain at oedi.

Before the end of this term, I will publish a White Paper which will pave the way for the introduction of an Agriculture (Wales) Bill during the sixth Senedd term. I intend the Bill to provide the legislative powers to regulate all aspects of the sale and use of snares in Wales.

Regards

**Lesley Griffiths AS/MS** 

Gweinidog yr Amgylchedd, Ynni a Materion Gwledig Minister for Environment, Energy and Rural Affairs

> Bae Caerdydd • Cardiff Bay Caerdydd • Cardiff CF99 1SN

Canolfan Cyswllt Cyntaf / First Point of Contact Centre: 0300 0604400

<u>Gohebiaeth.Lesley.Griffiths@llyw.cymru</u>
Correspondence.Lesley.Griffiths@gov.wales



## NATIONAL ANTI SNARING CAMPAIGN











www.antisnaring.org.uk

info@antisnaring.org.uk

new codes instead.

Petition to ban the Snaring of Animals in Wales for the Fur Trade. To be considered by the Environment Committee of the Welsh Assembly on Tuesday 13<sup>th</sup> October 2020 on behalf of National Anti - Snaring Campaign

Further comments for consideration relating to the White Paper Agriculture (Wales) Bill during sixth Senedd term: regulation of sale and use of snares in Wales:

The Code of Best Practice on the Use of Snares for Fox Control under Section 14 of the Animal Welfare Act was introduced by the Welsh Parliament in 2015. Simon Wild representing NASC addressed the Welsh Environment Committee prior to this and was asking for a complete ban. A snared wild animal is protected as in the "control of man" under the Animal Welfare Act 2006. Domestic animals are also protected. We believe the committee were persuaded that the new GWCT snare would ensure "the suffering could reasonably have been avoided or reduced", as required by the Act and so agreed

However, this was misguided for two reasons:

 Anyone can buy snares online and go for the cheapest (usually Chinese snares). No training or knowledge of the code is required. Many outlets sell the cheaper snare in Wales and rest of UK. No policing takes place and no one knows who has set a snare. 2) The new snare with stop, swivel and breaking point (although I defy any Senedd member to break the weak point, no matter how hard the pull) was proven by DEFRA, working with the Game and Wildlife Conservation Trust to cause significant injury and death to target and non-target animals. As many badgers as foxes were caught during some of the testing sessions See:

DETERMINING THE EXTENT OF USE AND HUMANENESS OF SNARES IN ENGLAND AND WALES

http://randd.defra.gov.uk/Document.aspx?Document=9872 wm0315-humaneness-snares.pdf

-----

BBC Wales, March 2020 showed David Smede, snaring foxes in Pembrokeshire National Park and selling the pelts to the European fur trade



\_\_\_\_\_

## Cat caught in snare in Wales, April 2019



A cat owner whose pet went missing for two days has spoken of her shock at finding the animal trapped in a wire snare normally set to catch badgers or foxes. Kate Lee, of Talsarn, said her pet cat Gem was only spared a lingering death after her distraught children came across her while carrying out a frantic search two fields away from their smallholding. "Gem had last been seen at around 5pm on the Sunday and didn't come home that night," she told the *Cambrian News*. "She then didn't turn up for breakfast the next morning which was very unusual. "When she still hadn't turned up the following day we went walking down the road to check whether she'd been run over and also looked in vehicles and outbuildings in case she'd been locked in. "We have 23 acres here and it was while going round our fields that the kids found her in the snare and we eventually got her out by using a pair of wire cutters. "Poor Gem was very dehydrated and while she let us carry her home she wouldn't let us touch her after that because she was so sore. "She also couldn't walk properly with her hind legs and didn't have anything to eat for 24 hours. Even now, a few days later, she's very tender around the middle."While I understand why people set these traps I think they should be set more responsibly and checked every 24 hours. "When we went back to the snare four days later it was still the same as when we had released Gem which means it hadn't been checked in all that time." I dread to think what would have happened if the kids hadn't found her - she would still be out there."

# Badger found heavily entangled in snare and barbed wire in Lampeter

Posted on 13/03/2018 by Gillian Hillan

A female badger has died after being found heavily entangled in a snare and barbed wire.

The adult female badger was found in the Lampeter area and was believed to have been trapped for a few days.



RSPCA animal collection officer (ACO) Ellie

West said: "The badger was very tangled up at the bottom of some fencing. There was no way the badger could have escaped, but luckily I was able to cut all wire and take the badger immediately to an independent vets.

"The badger was sedated and during the examination the vet found that the snare had become totally embedded into her stomach. There was infection and was very swollen and sore and it is likely that the badger had been there for at least three days.

"Sadly, to prevent further suffering the vet decided that the kindest thing to do was to put the badger to sleep.

"This incident really does highlight the cruel and indiscriminate nature of snares."

The device was not a self-locking snare, which are illegal, but it was not set in accordance with the Welsh Government's Code of Practice regarding snare use."

\_\_\_\_\_

#### 8 Jan. 2020 Fox snared near Cardiff





(note snare is old AB type)

Vale Wildlife Hospital post: RSPCA rescued a severely injured fox from a snare: The fox had this snare wrapped around his hind limbs and abdomen – both back legs were very swollen with significant bruising and will need careful monitoring for tissue breakdown, a risk associated with this type of injury.

Report: Simon Wild, National Anti-Snaring Campaign

# Agenda Item 5.1

# P-05-825 Protect children's lungs from harmful pollution whilst at school

This petition was submitted by British Lung Foundation Cymru, having collected 159 signatures.

### **Text of Petition**

People in towns and cities across Wales are breathing in levels of air pollution that are illegal and harmful for their health. Children are among those most vulnerable to air pollution. Their lungs are still growing, and polluted air can stunt the growth of their lungs and increase the likelihood of asthma and other health problems later on in life.

A freedom of information request by the BLF to local authorities in 2017 found that 68% of respondents (15 out of 22) were not monitoring air pollution within 10 metres of any of their schools.

We, the undersigned, call on the Welsh Government to require all Local Authorities to monitor the quality of the air children breathe whilst at school so decision-makers have the information they need to take action on air pollution.

## **Assembly Constituency and Region**

- Cardiff South and Penarth
- South Wales Central

P-05-825 Protect children's lungs from harmful pollution whilst at school - Welsh Government's Clean Air Plan - 6 August 2020

"We have to take action now" - Minister launches Welsh Government's Clean Air Plan for Wales to improve air quality

The Welsh Government has today (Thursday, August 6) outlined the measures it will take to improve the country's air quality under its Clean Air Plan for Wales: Healthy Air, Healthy Wales.

Poor air quality is the biggest environmental risk to public health and also has effects on biodiversity and the natural environment.

In Wales, poor air quality contributes to a reduced life expectancy equivalent to between 1,000 and 1,400 deaths each year – often having a pronounced impact on the most vulnerable, such as the very young or very old, and those with respiratory and cardiovascular conditions.

The Clean Air Plan identifies a range of actions to be delivered by the Welsh Government and our partners to improving the nation's air quality.

The measures outlined in the Plan will work alongside existing schemes to reduce public exposure to air pollution.

These actions will reduce air pollution, health risks and inequalities in order to improve public health.

They will also support our natural environment through actions supporting biodiversity and Welsh agriculture, reducing emissions from industry and creating sustainable places to live in, which will improve our quality of life.

The Plan links strategies and initiatives which encourage more people to walk, cycle, or use public transport complementing the Active Travel Act and the Welsh Government's Transforming Towns Initiative.

Some of the measures include:

- significant investment in active travel infrastructure, improving rail services and supporting decarbonisation through our aim for a zero tailpipe exhaust emission taxi and bus fleet by 2028.
- investigating measures to support a reduction in personal vehicle use such as road user charging, Clean Air Zones and/or Low Emission Zones.

- implementing our electric vehicle charging strategy and supporting an increase in the proportion of vehicles which are ultra-low emission (ULEV) and promoting a shift to ULEVs for waste collection.
- reviewing the powers local authorities have to tackle emissions from domestic burning.
- investigating the contribution bonfires and fireworks make to levels of harmful emissions
- increasing air quality monitoring through the development of a new Air Pollution Monitoring Network to protect the public, especially those most vulnerable, from air pollution.
- intelligent tree and hedge planting alongside expanding woodlands to support air quality improvements.
- · strengthening the control of emissions in agriculture.
- delivering enhanced behaviour change communications and producing new statutory guidance to help protect workforces from exposure to air pollution.
- proposals for a new Clean Air Act for Wales to enhance existing legislation and introduce new powers to further tackle air pollution.

Lesley Griffiths, the Minister for Environment, Energy and Rural Affairs, launched the new plan with a visit to Castle Street in Cardiff, where Cardiff Council is taking urgent action to tackle high levels of nitrogen dioxide emissions.

Castle Street has been closed to vehicles with road space being reallocated to create a two-way cycle lane to improve the route through the city centre. Cardiff Council are working to reshape the city centre to prioritise pedestrian safety, whilst supporting cycle and bus access in both the city centre and between key local centres.

The new measures on Castle Street are one of a number of changes carried out by local authorities across Wales – supported by Welsh Government – in order to curb emissions and improve air quality locally.

#### The Minister said:

I am very pleased to announce the launch of our Clean Air Plan, which sets out how we will look to improve air quality across Wales, and deal with those problems caused by air pollution, during the next 10 years.

The aims outlined in the Plan are there to safeguard the most vulnerable, but improving our air quality nationwide will be to the benefit of everyone in Wales, and it's something we should all want and strive for. But in order to achieve that, we have to take action now.

Much of that work is already underway – despite the recent pandemic, we have been able to support local authorities in commencing work on schemes to improve air quality across Wales, with the changes to Castle Street being one example.

We know that as people across Wales have responded to those restrictions imposed due to the Covid-19 pandemic, they have changed how they do things and taken on new habits - including decreasing their reliance on cars, and doing more in their local areas, rather than feeling the need to travel long distances.

#### The Minister added:

While the work outlined in the plan will run across government, the measures involved cannot be achieved by government alone - well have a role to play in ensuring that we tackle the problems of air pollution and poor air quality.

While the Clean Air Plan will require us all to play our part in tackling poor air quality, the recent actions undertaken by the people of Wales show what we can do when we come together in order to protect the most vulnerable, and to respond to those problems which face all of us.

Joseph Carter, Chair of Healthy Air Cymru, said:

Having been involved in the development of this plan, we are incredibly proud of what it has become. This ambitious proposal offers the opportunity to transform our country and create a greener, healthier Wales.

However, this plan cannot be delivered overnight and will need support from everyone across Wales. Now is the time to make this issue a priority - this is about delivering for people and communities across Wales.

We all have a role to play in improving air quality across Wales, and through working together, we can build upon it and work together to deliver for future generations. Let's make 2021 the fresh start Wales needs, by passing this ambitious plan through a robust Clean Air Act."

An earlier version of the Plan went out for public consultation in December; the revised Plan in its present form follows that consultation, which lasted for 12 weeks.

The consultation included events with stakeholders and engagement events with young people.

• Clean Air Plan for Wales: Healthy Air, Healthy Wales

Regus House, Falcon Drive, Cardiff Bay Cardiff CF10 4RU Tŷ Regus, Falcon Drive, Bae Caerdydd, Caerdydd CF10 4RU

Helpline: 03000 030 555

wales@auk-blf.org.uk
asthma.org.uk | blf.org.uk





THE ASTHMA UK AND BRITISH LUNG FOUNDATION PARTNERSHIP

Deputy Clerk
Petitions Committee
Senedd Cymru
Cardiff
CF99 INA

06 October 2020

### Dear Sirs,

- I. We write in reply to the request submitted by the committee for further comments and thoughts on the Clean Air Plan for Wales concerning the petition 'Protecting Children's Lungs from Harmful Pollution whilst at School'.
- 2. First, we would like to thank the committee for further opportunity to elaborate on our concerns that we initially raised on 21 January 2020. In our response, we will refer to matters raised in our previous correspondence to the committee, dated 15.01.20.
- 3. Secondly, having been involved in the development of this plan, we are incredibly proud of what it has become. This ambitious proposal offers the opportunity to transform our country and create a greener, healthier Wales.
- 4. The proposed plan commits to several asks raised by the British Lung Foundation (Now Asthma UK and British Lung Foundation (AUK-BLF)) through the Healthy Air Cymru Group and seeks to enshrine them in a new Clean Air Act, we welcome:
  - a. Enshrining in law new WHO air quality guidelines,
  - b. Reviewing and updating legislative instruments to review air quality strategies every five years,
  - c. Increasing local monitoring by providing statutory duty on local authorities to assess air pollution
  - d. Introducing a White Paper on a new Clean Air Act for Wales.
- 5. Thirdly, it is quite clear that COVID-19 has had an impact on everyone, as the only lung charity looking after the nation's lungs we note the impact to our beneficiaries, families and communities across the country. Therefore, we cannot respond without taking into account the effect that COVID-19 has had on our environment, air quality and health.
- 6. The cost of such changes is deadly, and when submitting evidence, we do so with remorse at the human toll to record such a reduction.
- 7. However, pollution levels collated by the University of Swansea have noted the significant drop in NO<sub>2</sub> concentrations across Wales. The reduction is significantly lower, where roadside emissions are the main contributory factor. The effects of which have been felt by our beneficiaries with lung conditions and will benefit everyone's lung health, especially children's developing lungs.

### Funding at a Local Authority Level

- 8. In our previous correspondence, we welcomed the reforms to powers at local authority (LA) level such as the proposed reform to smoke control zones and domestic burning, legislation which is long overdue for reform. However, we had concerns about the financial implications for councils to implement such new frameworks to tackle air pollution.
- 9. Although there is no direct mentioning of funding to be made available in the Clean Air Plan, there are increased references in the plan to increase resources for local authorities. However, there are still some concerns about a lack of direct promises for further funding for future clean air improvements. Recent actions by the Welsh Government has gone some way to alleviate those concerns many are referenced in the Clean Air Plan:
  - a. £Im of capital funding which has been made available to accelerate the deployment of Ultra Low Emission (ULE) refuse collection vehicles in the Welsh public sector.<sup>iii</sup>
  - b. £69 million to develop walking and cycling routes, facilities and improvements to existing infrastructure. iv
  - c. Recent £15.4 million to LAs to introduce measures to improve the safety and conditions for sustainable active travel modes in response to the COVID-19 crisis.
  - d. Promise to work across Govern partan partan partaners to develop and align behaviour change programmes to promote active travel. vi

- e. Increased budget by 50% for the Active Journeys programme, which promotes walking, cycling and scooting to school to reduce air pollution at the school gates.vii
- £25 million for Cardiff and Caerphilly councils to comply with Legal compliance NO2 limits. viii
- 10. We stress that there needs to be continued investment in our local communities to improve air pollution and reduce the health impacts on our future generations. Further, in authorities where the £15.4 Million of funding was granted, we call for a detailed analysis of the monitoring measures undertaken of areas of known air quality issues. Such an analysis is vital to highlight the positive health, economic and environmental impacts of such interventions so that future local authorities can suggest such means to be implemented when they update their air quality management plans.
- 11. Further, we note the impact that working from home has had on the reduction of air pollution. As mentioned earlier concentrations of NO<sub>2</sub> in Wales has fallen during the pandemic.
- 12. This is directly linked to the reduction of human activity as we were all asked to stay home and then to stay local.
- 13. One of the significant impacts is the increase in people working from home. Research conducted towards the end of the first wave of the pandemic noted that close to half of all working adults (41%) had travelled to work between the 11th - 14th, June 2020. This is compared to the recent release (October 1st 2020) of 59% (a fall from 64% from the previous week). The same release highlights that a third of the working force is currently working from home.
- 14. Common sense alone can make the link that if we continue to improve resources and access to support for our workforce to work from home, then the commute to work will continue to remain low and could fall further. Such a reduction in the commute to work will, in turn, reduce traffic during hours when children are either walking, cycling, scooting or been driven to school. Meaning that in the short term, whilst combustion vehicles are still driven and active travel provisions are being improved, if we continue to work from home more, school children will be exposed to less air pollution.

#### **Exclusion Zones**

- 15. As highlighted above, we welcome the increased funding and promotion of walking and cycling to school through the Active Journeys Programme, which is in collaboration with over 400 schools across Wales. However, there is still no direct comments in the plan around School Exclusion Zones.
- 16. The plan does highlight welcomed planned changes to strengthen car idling laws which pollute our streets unnecessarily as the car remains idle. Such idling concerns the charity and members of HAC, as such idling is seen at the school gates, increasing the levels of air pollution that children breathe. However, there is no direct mention of school exclusion zones.
- 17. To remind members of the committee, a school exclusion zone is a zone around a school where parents are encouraged not to drive their car to school and promote active travel instead. Such a measure could be applied alongside a 'park and stride' model (Living Streets toolkit herexi) where parents are recommended to park at another location and walk with their children or a group of children in the supervision of an adult instead of driving to the school gates.
- 18. We further highlighted in our previous response that children growing up around severe air pollution are five times more likely to have poor lung development. High levels of air pollution from vehicles has been linked to worsening of symptoms of conditions such as asthma, which is common in children.
- 19. Sustrans, in partnership with 'playing out', is working with local authorities and schools in implementing exclusion zones around schools in Wales. The plan could incorporate such a method to reduce air pollution around schools and legislate to strengthen such initiatives.
- 20. We would like to see school exclusion zones to be a tool available to local authorities across Wales. There are areas where it is harder to implement due to a school's proximity to the main road; however, if the plan seeks to strengthen anti-idling laws, then school exclusion zones should be part of that reform and sought to implemented where practical.

#### **WHO Guidelines**

- 21. In our previous correspondence to the committee, we highlighted our concern that there is no direct commitment in the draft clean air plan to legislate WHO (World Health Organisation) air quality guidance.
- 22. In the current plan, it states that the Welsh Government plan is to improve air quality by: 'New evidence-based, healthfocused targets for fine particulate matter (which take account of stringent WHO guidelines values) and improving national air pollution monitoring and modelling capabilities. vii
- 23. Although we are concerned that there isn't a direct promise of the new Clean Air Act to legislate for WHO limits, there are, however, optimistic promises for '... concentrations across Wales to below the WHO guideline for PM2.5 where it is possible, and lower still where there is sufficient potential, and there is high public exposure or risk to sensitive receptor groups.'xiii

## Pack Page 147 24. The plan highlights that the future targets for PM2.5 are underpinned by the right evidence and metrics to achieve the most

significant improvement to air quality. This target is based on the current lack of understanding and analysis of measures to

- achieve WHO guidance everywhere in Wales. The plan highlights that a Clean Air Advisory Panel has been established to provide independent, evidence-based advice and air quality matters in Wales.
- 25. We welcome the plan's commitment to reduce levels of air pollution to the lowest levels possible, as there are no 'healthy' levels of air pollution. However, we believe that the new Clean Air Act for Wales should at least set an ambition for WHO guidelines to become Wales' legal air quality limits. We understand that further research and advice may need to be taken; however, the Welsh Government should ask of the panel of when Wales could achieve such a target and legislate a timetable for implementation.

#### The Clean Air White Paper

- 26. In our previous response, we expressed concerns about the lack of detail in the draft Clean Air Plan of the detail of the White Paper for a new Clean Air Act for Wales.
- 27. We further stressed that a Bill should be debated in this Senedd term. However, our call was made before the start of the COVID-19 pandemic, and we understand that the Senedd's time has been allocated to focus on the crisis.
- 28. We, therefore, welcome the plan's commitment for a White Paper to be introduced at the end of this Senedd term.
- 29. In our previous response, the draft Clean Air Plan didn't grant much detail as to the contents of the White Paper for a Clean Air Act for Wales. Some of our concerns have been alleviated as the plan sets out:
  - a. Consultation on LAQM legislative intent in a White Paper by the end of this Senedd term.xiv
  - b. The Welsh Government will publish and seek to consult on a White Paper on a Clean Air Act for Wales before the end of this Senedd Term.\*\*
  - c. The plan highlights further examination of the evidence base for strengthening anti-idling measures and will set out proposals during 2020, in the Clean Air Act White Paper.\*\*
  - d. The Welsh Government will publish and consult on a White Paper on a Clean Air Act for Wales before the end of this Senedd Term.\*\*
- 30. However, concerningly there is no further detail as to the contents of the Clean Air White Paper. Because of the nature of the proposed instrument used to introduce the new Act, there will also be no clear funding plans to accompany the aims and ambitions of this plan and no need to provide further detail than what is already stated in the Clean Air Plan.
- 31. We would call for the Clean Air Plan for Wales to be introduced by the Environment, Energy and Rural Affairs Minister in the Senedd to allow Members of the Senedd the proper chance to scrutiny the planned proposals and highlight their concerns for the plan. Such a statement and questions after that might unveil possible future content of the White Paper and place positive pressure on the Welsh Government to deliver this White Paper by the end of this Senedd term.

Warm Regards,

Joseph Carter

Head of Devolved Nations

Asthma UK & British Lung Foundation Wales.

1.Colo

- iii Clean Air Plan for Wales, <a href="https://gov.wales/sites/default/files/publications/2020-08/clean-air-plan-for-wales-healthy-air-healthy-wales.pdf">https://gov.wales/sites/default/files/publications/2020-08/clean-air-plan-for-wales-healthy-air-healthy-wales.pdf</a> Page 54.
- iv Clean Air Plan for Wales, <a href="https://gov.wales/sites/default/files/publications/2020-08/clean-air-plan-for-wales-healthy-air-healthy-wales.pdf">https://gov.wales/sites/default/files/publications/2020-08/clean-air-plan-for-wales-healthy-air-healthy-wales.pdf</a> Page 61.
- <sup>v</sup> Clean Air Plan for Wales, <a href="https://gov.wales/sites/default/files/publications/2020-08/clean-air-plan-for-wales-healthy-air-healthy-wales.pdf">https://gov.wales/sites/default/files/publications/2020-08/clean-air-plan-for-wales-healthy-air-healthy-wales.pdf</a> Page 62.
- vi Clean Air Plan for Wales, https://gov.wales/sites/default/files/publications/2020-08/clean-air-plan-for-wales-healthy-air-healthy-wales.pdf Page 62.
- vii Clean Air Plan for Wales, <a href="https://gov.wales/sites/default/files/publications/2020-08/clean-air-plan-for-wales-healthy-air-healthy-wales.pdf">https://gov.wales/sites/default/files/publications/2020-08/clean-air-plan-for-wales-healthy-air-healthy-wales.pdf</a> Page 62.
- viii Clean Air Plan for Wales, <a href="https://gov.wales/sites/default/files/publications/2020-08/clean-air-plan-for-wales-healthy-air-healthy-wales.pdf">https://gov.wales/sites/default/files/publications/2020-08/clean-air-plan-for-wales-healthy-air-healthy-wales.pdf</a> Page 66.
- <sup>ix</sup> Coronavirus and the latest indicators for the UK economy and society: 18 June 2020, ONS. Link to data can be found here:
- https://www.ons.gov.uk/peoplepopulationandcommunity/healthandsocialcare/conditionsanddiseases/bulletins/coronavirust heukeconomyandsocietyfasterindicators/18june2020.
- <sup>x</sup> Coronavirus and the latest indicators for the UK economy and society: 18 June 2020, ONS. Link to data can be found here:
- https://www.ons.gov.uk/peoplepopulationandcommunity/healthandsocialcare/conditionsanddiseases/bulletins/coronavirust heukeconomyandsocietyfasterindicators/1october2020#social-impacts-of-the-coronavirus-on-great-britain.
- xi Living Streets, Park and Stride Toolkit, https://www.livingstreets.org.uk/media/2035/park-and-stride-print.pdf.
- xii Clean Air Plan for Wales, <a href="https://gov.wales/sites/default/files/publications/2020-08/clean-air-plan-for-wales-healthy-air-healthy-wales.pdf">https://gov.wales/sites/default/files/publications/2020-08/clean-air-plan-for-wales-healthy-air-healthy-wales.pdf</a> Page 6.
- xiii Clean Air Plan for Wales, <a href="https://gov.wales/sites/default/files/publications/2020-08/clean-air-plan-for-wales-healthy-air-healthy-wales.pdf">https://gov.wales/sites/default/files/publications/2020-08/clean-air-plan-for-wales-healthy-air-healthy-wales.pdf</a> Page 27.
- xiv Clean Air Plan for Wales, <a href="https://gov.wales/sites/default/files/publications/2020-08/clean-air-plan-for-wales-healthy-air-healthy-wales.pdf">https://gov.wales/sites/default/files/publications/2020-08/clean-air-plan-for-wales-healthy-air-healthy-wales.pdf</a> Page 33.
- <sup>xv</sup> Clean Air Plan for Wales, <a href="https://gov.wales/sites/default/files/publications/2020-08/clean-air-plan-for-wales-healthy-air-healthy-wales.pdf">https://gov.wales/sites/default/files/publications/2020-08/clean-air-plan-for-wales-healthy-air-healthy-wales.pdf</a> Page 39.
- xvi Clean Air Plan for Wales, <a href="https://gov.wales/sites/default/files/publications/2020-08/clean-air-plan-for-wales-healthy-air-healthy-wales.pdf">https://gov.wales/sites/default/files/publications/2020-08/clean-air-plan-for-wales-healthy-air-healthy-wales.pdf</a> Page 65.
- xvii Clean Air Plan for Wales, <a href="https://gov.wales/sites/default/files/publications/2020-08/clean-air-plan-for-wales-healthy-air-healthy-wales.pdf">https://gov.wales/sites/default/files/publications/2020-08/clean-air-plan-for-wales-healthy-air-healthy-wales.pdf</a> Page 73.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Correspondence 15.01.20 for item 3, meeting 21/01/20. https://business.senedd.wales/documents/s97590/15.01.20%20Correspondence%20-%20Petitioner%20to%20Committee.pdf Accessed 5<sup>th</sup> of October 2020.

ii Swansea University Trend Analysis of Air Pollution in Wales. Link to data can be found here: <a href="https://chemri.shinyapps.io/Air pollution change in Wales 2020/">https://chemri.shinyapps.io/Air pollution change in Wales 2020/</a>

## Agenda Item 5.2

# P-05-937 STOP BOILING CRUSTACEANS ALIVE (lobsters, crabs, crayfish, prawns etc)

This petition was submitted by Cardiff Animal Rights having collected 1,253 signatures online and 505 on paper, a total of 2,008 signatures.

### **Text of Petition**

We call on the National Assembly for Wales to urge the Welsh Government to implement greater protection for crustaceans and to ban the cruel practice of boiling lobsters, crabs crayfish, prawns etc alive.

Zoologists have found that, unlike humans, lobsters and other crustaceans DON'T have the ability to go into 'shock,' so when they are plunged into a pot of BOILING water, their suffering is prolonged. When other animals, including humans, experience extreme pain, their nervous system shuts down as a coping mechanism. Scientists have found that it takes lobsters & crabs up to 45 seconds to die when plunged into a pot of BOILING water (something which would be considered completely unacceptable in a vertebrate animal like a cow or a pig). To give this perspective, if they are dismembered their nervous system can still function for up to an hour.

The Animal Welfare Act is designed to protect animals on the understanding that sentient creatures can feel pain and we have a moral duty NOT to cause suffering. The Act makes it an offence to cause unnecessary suffering to any animal, both in their keeping and at the time of slaughter. It means that people or organisations who neglect or abuse 'protected' animals can be prosecuted. 'Farmed animals', fish and reptiles are all protected under this Act. However, invertebrates such as crabs and lobsters, crayfish & prawns are not.

Moreover, live crustaceans have been found for sale awaiting their fate on ice trays, packaged and bound tightly in tanks or plastic to be slaughtered at home by the customer. It is considered an act of animal cruelty to boil a lobster alive in Switzerland. The Swiss now need to stun or kill animals before boiling them and lobsters can't be kept alive on ice.

Extend the Animal Welfare Act 2006 to include crustaceans including Lobsters, crabs, prawns & crayfish etc.

## **Assembly Constituency and Region**

- Cardiff North
- South Wales Central

# P-05-937 STOP BOILING CRUSTACEANS ALIVE (lobsters, crabs, crayfish, prawns etc), Correspondence – Petitioner to Committee, 03.09.20

Hello,

Thank you for your correspondence, my apologies for the late reply. I appreciate the update and have linked a few articles of the subject including a recent article outlining the British Veterinary Association campaign to make illegal the boiling alive of Lobsters, and an open letter to the UK government in 2018 (see below) that has been signed by eminent scientists, veterinary professionals, lawyers, actors, comedians and wildlife experts, including the RSPCA and the British Veterinary Association, asking the government to protect them in animal welfare law, which has been launched by campaign group <a href="https://www.crustaceancompassion.org.uk/">https://www.crustaceancompassion.org.uk/</a>, I hope this will provide you with evidence of how much backing the call for the banning of boiling lobsters alive has in the UK and that Wales could lead by example in banning this barbaric act of cruelty.

I will be sending more information soon, but I await your reply.

Kind Regards

Rachel Ward Cardiff Animal Rights

https://www.thoughtco.com/do-lobsters-feel-pain-4163893

https://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-8677803/British-vets-launch-battle-stop-lobsters-boiled-alive-new-scientific-evidence.html

https://www.crustaceancompassion.org.uk/

Rt Hon Michael Gove MP Secretary of State for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs Nobel House 17 Smith Square Westminster London SW1P 3JR

31st January 2018

Dear Minister,

We the undersigned write out of concern for the welfare of decapod crustaceans who remain unprotected by animal welfare legislation. Based on recent compelling scientific evidence that they are sentient and therefore can experience pain, and in light of the extreme practices they are subjected to, we call on the government to include decapod crustaceans under the definition of 'animal' in the Animal Welfare Bill (Sentencing and Recognition of Sentience) and in the Animal Welfare Act 2006.

Decapod crustaceans are protected under animal welfare legislation in Norway, Switzerland, Austria, New Zealand and some Australian states and territories; as well as in some regions of Germany and Italy. Yet in the UK, decapods fall outside of the legal definition of 'animal' in the Animal Welfare Act 2006, and so there is currently no legal requirement for food processors, supermarkets or restaurants to consider their welfare during storage, handling or killing. However, Section 1 of the Act provides for the inclusion of invertebrates of any description "if the appropriate national authority is satisfied, on the basis of scientific evidence, that animals of the kind concerned are capable of experiencing pain or suffering" (Animal Welfare Act, 2006). Since the Animal Welfare Act 2006 was introduced, a body of scientific evidence has emerged which strongly indicates that decapod crustaceans do not merely respond to nociceptive stimuli, but are capable of experiencing pain. Avoidance learning, rapid behaviour change, prolonged rubbing of affected areas, the laying down of memories, and motivational trade-offs are among the criteria for pain experience that have been observed. A scientific summary is attached.

Despite this evidence, decapods are frequently seen crammed together in brightly lit tanks in food retail establishments with no consideration for their welfare; are frequently sold live to the consumer for amateur home storage and killing; and have even been found for sale live yet entirely immobilised in shrink-wrap. There is no economic or culinary reason why decapods cannot be humanely dispatched, yet killing is sometimes preceded by breaking off the legs, head or tail, and is often

accomplished by boiling alive. Roth and Øines (2010) estimate that an edible crab boiled alive may remain conscious for at least three minutes.

More than 23,000 people have signed a petition online (change.org, 2018) and on paper to include decapods in the Animal Welfare Act 2006, and 41 animal welfare organisations have supported this recommendation in a joint post-Brexit animal welfare manifesto (Wildlife and Countryside Link, 2018). Given the strength of the existing evidence, the scale of suffering involved, and the public interest in this issue, we believe that the time has come to join other nations in recognising the sentience of these animals.

Yours sincerely,

1

Maisie Tomlinson Campaign Director Crustacean Compassion

2

Professor Michael C. Appleby OBE Honorary Fellow. Expert researcher, educator and author on animal welfare, member of FAWC 2007-16. University of Edinburgh

3 Bill Bailey Comedian, Actor, Presenter

4

Claire Bass Executive Director Humane Society International UK

5

Professor Marc Bekoff Professor Emeritus of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology University of Colorado,

6

Boulder

Professor Culum Brown

Associate Professor and Assistant Editor of the Journal of Fish Biology Macquarie University

7

Ian Cawsey

Animal Advocate. Member of Parliament 1997-2010, and Former Chair of the Associate Parliamentary Group for Animal Welfare (APGAW).

8

Eddie Clutton Dipl ECVAA MRCA

Director: Wellcome Trust Critical Care Laboratory for Large Animals; Academic Head: Veterinary Anaesthesia / BVSc MRCVS DVA Roslin Institute, Edinburgh

9

Dr Alasdair Cochrane Senior Lecturer in Political Theory The University of Sheffield

10

Martin Cooke MRCVS Veterinary Invertebrate Society

11

Simon Doherty BVMS CertAqV MRCVS MRQA CBiol FRSB Director / Certified Aquaculture Veterinarian Blackwater Consultancy Ltd

12

Peter Egan

Actor and Animal Welfare Campaigner

13

Professor Bob Evans Emeritus Professor of History University of Oxford

14

Ricardo Fajardo

International Animal Welfare Legislative Expert; and El Derecho de los Animales ("Animal Law") author, 2007

15

John Fishwick

President, British Veterinary Association; and signing on behalf of the British Veterinary Association

16

Charles Foster MA, VetMB, PhD, MRCVS Fellow of Green Templeton College

## University of Oxford

17

Professor Robert Garner Professor of Politics University of Leicester

18

Professor Peter Godfrey-Smith Professor of History and Philosophy of Science University of Sydney

19

Professor Stevan Harnad Professor Emeritus of Cognitive Science Editor, Animal Sentience University of Southampton

20

Vanessa Hudson Leader Animal Welfare Party

21

Dr Robert C. Jones Associate Professor of Philosophy California State University, Chico

22

Professor Andrew Knight MANZCVS, DipECAWBM (AWSEL), DipACAW, PhD, FRCVS, SFHEA Professor of Animal Welfare and Ethics University of Winchester

23

Dr Dan Lyons CEO, Centre for Animals and Social Justice The University of Sheffield

24

Dr Heather Maggs Postdoctoral researcher University of Reading

25

Professor Jennifer Mather Professor, Psychology University of Lethbridge, AB Canada Dr Steven McCulloch BVSc BA PhD DipECAWBM(AWSEL) MRCVS Acting Director, Centre for Animal Welfare. Recognised European Veterinary Specialist in Animal Welfare Science, Ethics and Law / Centre for Animal Welfare, University of Winchester

27

Dr Alan McElligott Reader in Animal Behaviour University of Roehampton

28

Dr Dorothy McKeegan BVA Animal Welfare Foundation Senior Lecturer University of Glasgow

29

Fieke Molenaar MSc DZM(Mammalian) MRCVS President of British Veterinary Zoological Society British Veterinary Zoological Society

30

Jean-Marc Neumann Lawyer LLM, Secretary General of EGALS (Educational Group for Animal Law Studies), Director and Editor of Animal et Droit

31 Chris Packham Naturalist and Broadcaster

32
Dr Nick Palmer
Head of Policy
Compassion in World Farming

33
Dil Peeling BVSc MSc MRCVS
Formerly Senior Policy Officer, Eurogroup for Animals, Brussels

34 Dr Mirjam Prinz (nee Appel) PhD Biological Scientist Bavarian research institute of agriculture, Germany

35 Mike Radford OBE LLB Reader in Animal Welfare Law University of Aberdeen 36

lan Redmond OBE CBiol, HonDUni, DSc h.c., FLS Independent Wildlife Biologist and Conservationist

37

Paul Roger

Independent Veterinary Consultant and Chair of AWSELVA

38

Professor Anil K. Seth

Professor of Cognitive and Computational Neuroscience; Co-Director, Sackler Centre for Consciousness Science; Editor-in-Chief, Neuroscience of Consciousness University of Sussex

39

Dr Toni Shephard Executive Director Animal Equality

40

Kellie Shirley

**Actress** 

41

**Alick Simmons** 

Independent Veterinarian; Deputy Chief Veterinary Officer, 2008-2016

42

Dr Lynne Sneddon B.Sc. (Hons), PhD Director of Bioveterinary Science University of Liverpool

43

Ronnie Soutar BVM&S, MSc, MRCVS President Fish Veterinary Society

44

Michaela Strachan
TV Presenter and Conservationist

45

Dr Cedric Sueur

Head of the masters degree Animal Law and Ethics, Member of the French Council for Animal Experimentation Université de Strasbourg, France

46

Dr Alma Swan BSc (Zoology), PhD (Biology) Private individual

47

Dr Aurelie Thomas DVM, PhD, DipECAWBM (AWSEL), MRCVS Named Veterinary Surgeon Wellcome Sanger Institute

48

Lord Alexander Trees BVM&S, PhD, DVetMed, DVMS, MRCVS, HonFRSE Veterinarian/Crossbench Peer House of Lords

49

Wendy Turner Webster TV Presenter

50

Peter Tutt Coordinator The Shellfish Network

51

Gary Webster Actor

52

Professor John Webster MA, Vet MB, PhD, DVM (Hons, London), MRCVS Emeritus Professor of Animal Husbandry University of Bristol School of Veterinary Science

53

Dr Peter Wedderburn BVM&S CertVR MRCVS Veterinarian

54

Dr Sean Wensley BVSc MSc Grad.DMS MRCVS Senior Veterinary Surgeon PDSA

55

Dr Julia Wrathall Chief Scientific Officer RSPCA

## P-05-963 Require supermarkets to donate excess food to charity

This petition was submitted by Crosskeys My World My Home Group having collected a total of 84 signatures.

#### **Text of Petition**

Throughout the world, one third of all food produced annually is wasted. In the UK, that equates to about 9.5 million tonnes, which represents a huge waste of resources and unnecessary pressure on our environment. Despite this, from 2018 to 2019, Trussell Trust charity had to distribute a record 1.6 million food bank parcels in the UK. We believe that food should not be thrown away when there are people going hungry in this country.

In February 2016, France decided to take action against the food waste problem and mandated that its supermarkets donate all food nearing its sell-by-date to charity - a law that now rescues 46,000 tons of food from being thrown away every year, and has increased food bank donations in France by over 20%.

In 2019, the law was extended to encompass the institutional catering and agro-food industries. We believe that WE CAN DO THE SAME here in Wales by saving edible food and preventing our nation's supermarkets, restaurant chains and food suppliers from sending decent food to landfill. The Welsh Government has already been working with Fare Share Cymru to redistribute the equivalent of over 8 million meals since 2011.

By adopting the solution used in France, we can take a much bigger step towards ending hunger in Wales, as well as the Welsh Government's goal of halving food waste by 2025, which will also put us on the path to becoming Zero Waste by 2050.

Please sign this petition calling on the National Assembly for Wales to urge the Welsh Government to pass a law similar to the one in France to take a stand AGAINST food waste and FOR those in need.

#### Additional Information

For more information see the following materials:

France's food waste law extended to agrifood and catering businesses <a href="https://iegpolicy.agribusinessintelligence.informa.com/PL22264">https://iegpolicy.agribusinessintelligence.informa.com/PL22264</a> 6/Frances-food-waste-law-extended-to-agrifood-and-catering-businesses

Is France's Groundbreaking Food-Waste Law Working? <a href="https://pulitzercenter.org/reporting/frances-groundbreaking-food-waste-law-working">https://pulitzercenter.org/reporting/frances-groundbreaking-food-waste-law-working</a>

French law forbids food waste by supermarkets <a href="https://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/feb/04/french-law-forbids-food-waste-by-supermarkets">https://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/feb/04/french-law-forbids-food-waste-by-supermarkets</a>

Welsh Government aims to halve food waste by 2025 <a href="https://environmentjournal.online/articles/welsh-government-aims-halve-food-waste-2025/">https://environmentjournal.online/articles/welsh-government-aims-halve-food-waste-2025/</a>

The Trussell trust - <a href="https://www.trusselltrust.org/">https://www.trusselltrust.org/</a>

Fare Share Cymru – <a href="http://www.fareshare.cymru/en/home/">http://www.fareshare.cymru/en/home/</a>

WRAP Cymru - <a href="http://www.wrapcymru.org.uk/">http://www.wrapcymru.org.uk/</a>

### Senedd Constituency and Region

- Islwyn
- South Wales East

Lesley Griffiths AS/MS Gweinidog yr Amgylchedd, Ynni a Materion Gwledig Minister for Environment, Energy and Rural Affairs



Eich cyf/Your ref P-05-963 Ein cyf/Our ref LG/01745/20

Janet Finch-Saunders MS
Chair of the Petitions Committee
Government.Committee.Business@gov.wales

03 August 2020

#### **Dear Janet**

Thank you for your letter of 9 July regarding Petition P-05-963 which seeks supermarkets to donate excess food to charity.

In my letter of 26 May I outlined measures which supermarkets are undertaking nationally as well as providing reassurance supermarkets have arrangements in place at a local level to donate excess stock.

In dealing with excess stock, supermarkets follow the Food and Drink Waste hierarchy developed by WRAP. By following this hierarchy, supermarkets redistribute surplus food for human consumption before sending it to be redistributed as animal feed or any of the waste destinations. WRAP has reported, during the pandemic, food businesses are achieving this and ensuring food which cannot be sold at this time moves around the supply chain to feed people and is not wasted.

The UK Environment Bill is still subject to the Parliamentary process, however if passed, the powers in the Environment Bill would enable the relevant national authority to impose producer responsibility obligations and this could be utilised for the purposes of preventing food waste and redistribution of food surplus. Our current focus is however on the development of an Extended Producer Responsibilty Scheme for packaging on which we are working jointly with the other UK nations..

Regards

**Lesley Griffiths AS/MS** 

Gweinidog yr Amgylchedd, Ynni a Materion Gwledig Minister for Environment, Energy and Rural Affairs

> Bae Caerdydd • Cardiff Bay Caerdydd • Cardiff CF99 1SN

Canolfan Cyswllt Cyntaf / First Point of Contact Centre: 0300 0604400

<u>Gohebiaeth.Lesley.Griffiths@llyw.cymru</u>
Correspondence.Lesley.Griffiths@gov.wales

Rydym yn croesawu derbyn gohebiaeth yn Gymraeg. Byddwn yn ateb gohebiaeth a dderbynnir yn Gymraeg yn Gymraeg ac ni fydd gohebu yn Gymraeg yn arwain at oedi.

# P-05-963 Require supermarkets to donate excess food to charity, Correspondence – Petitioner to Committee, 06.10.20

Thank you for the opportunity once again to respond to the letter from the Petitions Committee. We commend your current focus on developing an Extended Producer Responsibility Scheme to tackle the issue of product packaging, and are also pleased to hear that the UK Government values the food waste hierarchy scheme developed by WRAP.

As was mentioned in previous correspondence from the committee, voluntary actions are being undertaken by the grocery and food retail industry as part of WRAP's Courtauld Commitment, with the aim of addressing environmental concerns relating to food waste, as well as the potential social benefits of its redistribution. The 2013-15 Courtauld Commitment led to an estimated 219,000 tonnes of food and packaging supply chain waste being saved, which is to be applauded. Another series of more ambitious targets are being set for the 2025 Courtauld Commitment, which counts just over 100 UK grocery retailers as its signatories so far.

We would like to note, however, that there were 30,680 businesses registered as grocery stores under the UK Standard Industrial Classification as of 2015. This means that the current voluntary signatories of WRAP's food waste reduction and redistribution targets account for less than 0.5% of all UK grocery retailers. It is due to these statistics that the Coleg Gwent My World My Home group feels that it would be highly beneficial to our country's future environmental prospects that the UK Environment Bill secures the necessary powers for the relevant national authority to impose obligations relating to food waste on UK retailers.

Finally, as aforementioned, we welcome the committee's pledge to tackle food packaging waste; however, we also wish to convey our conviction that both food waste and food packaging are not isolated issues. Initiatives that aim to tackle both food and packaging waste together are far more likely to succeed and have a further-reaching impact than attempting to tackle these issues in isolation.

As always, we are grateful for the opportunity to submit our response.

Yours sincerely,

Lyra Jannetta on behalf of My World My Home student environmental group at Coleg Gwent

# P-05-798 Male domestic violence victim support services to be independently run & funded

This petition was submitted by FNF Both Parents Matter Cymru and was first considered by the Committee in February 2018, having collected 138 signatures online.

### **Text of Petition**

Male domestic violence victim support services to be independently run & funded separately from Women's Aid Cymru & all associated.

The cross-government definition of domestic violence and abuse is: "Any incident or pattern of incidents of controlling, coercive, threatening behaviour, violence or abuse between those aged 16 or over who are, or have been, intimate partners or family members regardless of gender or sexuality."

Domestic Abuse can effect anyone. With more Male victims/survivors seeking help, advise, support & safety than ever before. It is important that Male victims deserve independent support & funding from such gender bias groups as Women's Aid Cymru & all associated.

Male victims/survivors deserve support/help specific to their needs, while still maintaining their dignity, & providing them and their children safety equal & parallel to that which women currently receive.

#### Additional Information

Current Domestic Abuse statistics across Wales & England, indicate that Domestic Abuse will affect 1 in 4 women and 1 in 6 men in their lifetime.

Domestic Abuse/Violence is a problem that can effect anyone so surely it should be:

"Putting people & their children first."

There is no greater gap in availability of services & support just based on someone's gender across Wales & UK.

Attitudes need to change because no person (& their children) should continue so publically & shamefully be denied safety & support because of their gender in Wales, in this day & age.

Please support this to help support others.

## Senedd Constituency and Region

- Cardiff West
- South Wales Central

Jane Hutt AS/MS
Y Dirprwy Weinidog a'r Prif Chwip
Deputy Minister and Chief Whip



Eich cyf/Your ref Ein cyf/Our ref JH-/00459/20

Janet Finch-Saunders MS Chair, Petitions Committee

20 July 2020

Dear Janet,

Thank you for your letter of 29 June, in which you enclosed the Petitions Committee Report on petition P-05-798, Male Domestic Violence Victim support services to be independently run and funded.

The Violence Against Women, Domestic Abuse and Sexual Violence Act ensures relevant authorities and organisations work to a shared, collective strategic vision which will move Wales towards a more consistent response which victims tell us is crucial. It will raise the issue of gender—based abuse, domestic abuse and sexual violence with our most senior leadership and place a responsibility on them to drive forward changes which improves the safety of all victims, including men and women and their children.

The Welsh Government recognises that the experience of men and women of all forms of abuse can be different and therefore requires a different response. The Act therefore requires a nuanced response to men and to women, reflecting their different experience and requiring an appropriate response which properly addresses their needs.

Local strategies, provision for which is included in the Act, must be based on a robust needs assessment by Local Authorities and Local Health Boards for their areas which will identify where men and women require different services and support. Services must be provided which meet the needs and experiences of men and women, and which acknowledge the different services these groups require and are proportionate to need. The Act will, therefore, enable a gender-specific response where necessary.

Canolfan Cyswllt Cyntaf / First Point of Contact Centre: 0300 0604400

<u>Gohebiaeth.Jane.Hutt@llyw.cymru</u> Correspondence.Jane.Hutt@gov.wales

Bae Caerdydd • Cardiff Bay Caerdydd • Cardiff CF99 1SN

Rydym yn croesawu derbyn gohebiaeth yn Gymraeg. Byddwn yn ateb gohebiaeth a dderbynnir yn Gymraeg yn Gymraeg ac ni fydd gohebu yn Gymraeg yn arwain at oedi.

The Welsh Government has also published statutory commissioning guidance which requires regional commissioning partnerships to work strategically to commission needs-based services. Where there is a need for support services for male victims of domestic abuse, regional commissioning arrangements should recognise this.

The commissioning cycles and rules governing the commissioning of services will vary between organisations and between regions. Where services are being procured, public sector organisations must adhere to public procurement rules.

In recognition more specifically male victims of domestic abuse and sexual violence, the Welsh Government funds Project Dyn which supports male victims.

Project Dyn provides frontline advocacy support for men, as well as telephone and web-based support and signposting to local services. The Project also delivers training and works to raise awareness across Wales about the issue and how best to support men in these circumstances. In addition, Welsh Government funded services, such as the Live Fear Free website, Live Fear Free Helpline and Bawso, support both men and women.

Whilst we understand the importance of reviewing all of our grant funded programmes from time to time, we feel that during a global pandemic it is not the appropriate time for the funding to be reviewed.

Yours Sincerely,

Jane Hutt AS/MS

Y Dirprwy Weinidog a'r Prif Chwip Deputy Minister and Chief Whip

# RESPONSE TO WELSH PARLIAMENT PETITIONS COMMITTEE – BOTH PARENTS MATTER CYMRU

# P-05-798 "Male domestic violence victim support services to be independently run & funded"

Response by petitioner to the Minister (Jane Hutt, Ref JH-/00459/20, 20<sup>th</sup> July 2020)

## **SUMMARY**

In response to the Minister we wish to make the following points:

- Service provision for male victims funded by Welsh Government is currently
  grounded in feminist theory that sees men as second class victims at best and lying
  perpetrators at worst.
- Service provision for men must be safely separated from services for women and delivered by organisations whose perspective is grounded in the experience of men.
- Service provision for male victims is disproportionately lower than that for women and other groups despite the Minister's explicit assurance to the Committee. We ask the Committee to seek data from Welsh Government on the number and percentage of male victims identified in each region of Wales. Until we have clarity on the extent of the problem it is difficult for Welsh Government to plan solutions.
- We ask the Committee to seek information on the terms of the funding of the Dyn Project specifically cost as well as outcome and output measures, and the number and percentage of male callers to the Live Fear Free Helpline, to ensure value for money.
- The revision of the National Strategy and Delivery Framework (2018-2021) provides the opportunity to ensure that services for men are separated from those for women. They must be funded according to need proportionate to the numbers of male victims identified in Regional Needs Assessments and must be grounded in the experience of men in terms of design and delivery. We seek the Minister's reassurances on this point.
- We ask the Member for the Rhondda to expand upon her comments made at the last session of the Committee when this petition was considered when she seemed to suggest that it was reasonable to assume that men are likely to lie about their experience while women should be believed.

It seems that the Minister has responded to the wrong question. We have not asked what support is available for male victims of domestic abuse. We have instead asked Welsh Government and the Petitions Committee to consider whether it is appropriate for male victims to be signposted to and supported by services that are grounded in the experience of women and that see men as second class victims at best and as lying perpetrators at worst. This is the experience of many men who have accessed other services.

We were struck by one particular sentence in the Minister's response:

Services must be provided which meet the needs and experiences of men and women, and which acknowledge the different services these groups require and are proportionate to need. The Act will, therefore, enable a gender-specific response where necessary.

We agree that services should be gender-specific. However the Minister's vision is simply not being realised. Public money is being used to design and deliver services for men that are grounded in feminist theory. This treats men and women differently – assuming that men are likely to lie about their experience whilst women must always be believed.

We request that the Petitions Committee ask the Minister what evidence she has that men's experience and voices have been included in the design and development of services for them. Their needs are absent from the Welsh Government strategy <sup>i</sup> They are mentioned in the most perfunctory way in the Cross Governmental Delivery Framework <sup>ii</sup>where it is stated that Welsh Government have:

- consulted with stakeholder groups that support men to inform our campaigns;
- engaged with young men and boys during the development work for 2018-2020 VAWDASV campaigns;

That just two mentions are made of male victims in a 29 page document demonstrates the lack of interest Welsh Government has in this issue. We also suspect that the 'stakeholder groups that support men' referred to above is a reference to our charity.

The petition called for services for male victims to be provided *independently* of "Women's Aid Cymru & all associated". Safer Wales who run the 'Dyn Project' is a member organisation of Welsh Women's Aid. Live Fear Free Helpline is commissioned from Welsh Women's Aid directly. We are aware of other member organisations of Welsh Women's Aid who are seeking and receiving public funding to provide services to male victims of domestic abuse. We contend that this is an inappropriate use of public funds.

The Minister correctly identifies that the provision of services to male victims by organisations primarily serving the women's sector, or having been developed from the women's sector, fails to fulfil the requirements of the Act. It is welcome to see recognition of this principle, but we see no evidence that this is being realised in the commissioning of services for male victims.

Whilst the specific experience and needs of male victims may differ from those of female victims, all parties will surely agree that equitability of approach must be the objective. In this respect it should be recalled that the Equality and Human Rights Commission (Wales Office) obtained independent legal opinion on a pertinent issue in 2017.

The view of the EHRC had been sought by a private individual via her Assembly Member (Mark Drakeford). The question related to the different treatment frequently encountered by male victims contacting support services who deploy Respect's "Toolkit for Work with Male Victims", or similar "screening" procedures such as the Dyn Project. The ruling of the EHRC, based on independent legal advice, was that, "a policy of screening male but not female callers to an advice line is likely to constitute direct discrimination, in breach of section13 of the Equality Act 2010". In further correspondence the EHRC noted that it remained lawful for the Dyn Project to use a 'screening' tool to determine whether callers were lying ONLY because the service did not support female callers.

https://gov.wales/sites/default/files/publications/2019-06/national-strategy-2016-to-2021.pdf

ii https://gov.wales/sites/default/files/publications/2019-06/cross-government-delivery-framework-2018-2021.pdf	

### P-05-906 Save Sam Davies Ward at Barry Hospital

This petition was submitted by UNISON having collected 1,858 signatures online and 11,407 on paper, a total of 13,265 signatures.

#### **Text of Petition**

We the undersigned call on the Welsh Government, being the ultimate body responsible for the provision of health care in Wales, to stop the proposal of the Cardiff & Vale UHB to close the Sam Davies Ward, a 23 bedded older persons acute rehabilitation ward at the Barry Hospital, and to ensure that the Barry Hospital continues to provide Health Services to the public of Barry the largest Town in Wales.

#### **Additional Information**

The Sam Davies Ward is a 23 bedded older persons acute rehabilitation ward. The services include stroke rehabilitation, orthopaedic rehabilitation, and medical rehabilitation amongst other key health services. The ward also has two respite beds

## Senedd Constituency and Region

- Cardiff Central
- South Wales Central



#### **Executive Headquarters / Pencadlys Gweithredol**

Woodland House Maes-y-Coed Road Cardiff CF14 4HH Ty Coedtir Ffordd Maes-y-Coed Caerdydd CF14 4HH

disability
confident

EMPLOYER -

Eich cyf/Your ref: Ein cyf/Our ref: LR-jtf-08-8219 Welsh Health Telephone Network: Direct Line/Llinell uniongychol: 02921 836010

Len Richards
Chief Executive

28 August 2020

Janet Finch-Saunders MS Welsh Parliament Cardiff Bay Cardiff CF99 1SN

Sent via email to: <a href="mailto:Petitions@senedd.wales">Petitions@senedd.wales</a>

Dear Janet

# Re: Petition P-05-906 Correspondence from the Chair of the Petitions Committee

Thank you for your letter regarding the above. In responding to the issues raised by the South Glamorgan CHC, I thought it would be helpful to share with you the correspondence the Health Board sent to CHC before and during the engagement process, and after the Board decision on the outcome of the engagement. I believe these demonstrate the way we were in continuous discussion with the CHC and how we responded to the issues they raised at the time and they have subsequently shared with you in their submission.

At our Board meeting in November 2019, we considered the outcome of the engagement and agreed a way forward. We acknowledged the petition as an element of the feedback received, as part of the Board papers – see link to the full Board papers below.

http://www.cardiffandvaleuhb.wales.nhs.uk/sitesplus/documents/1143/Public%20Board%20Agenda%20%26%20Papers%20Bundle.pdf

As highlighted below in an extract from Annex 1 of the Board paper, Unison shared copies of the petition both with the UHB and with the CHC at one of the public meetings held on 30 October.

Extract from Annex 1 of Board Paper - 'In addition to the feedback received directly by the Health Board, a petition organised by Unison and signed by circa 13,000 people, was presented to Welsh Government on 9 October. Copies were also shared with the Health Board and the CHC on 30 October. The petition called on Welsh Government to stop the proposal to close the Sam Davies ward and to ensure that Barry Hospital continues to provide health services to the public of Barry the largest town in Wales, and the Vale of Glamorgan.

The Board supported the way forward proposed in the Board paper, namely to take action to build public confidence in the frailty model and the future of Barry Hospital before proceeding with further consideration of the future of beds in the Sam Davies ward. This position was agreed subject to further consideration of the views of the CHC which had not been available at the time of the Board meeting.

The correspondence with the CHC in January and March 2020, which I have attached, responds to the formal position taken by the CHC which was reported to us in December. The correspondence also describes the work being progressed in relation to developing the frailty model and an invitation to join a project steering group for developing Barry as a Health and Wellbeing Centre. A crucial element of this was to oversee the approach to engagement/consultation with the public and stakeholders.

Like so many other pieces of development work, this had to be put on hold when the pandemic hit. Below is an update on the position related to the Frailty Intervention Team (FIT) and Sam Davies ward.

The Frailty Intervention Team (FIT) was piloted January – March 2020 to support patients presenting to the Medical Emergency and Assessment Unit (MEAU), University Hospital Llandough during the winter period. The FIT followed the pathway described in the public engagement which promotes the provision of early specialist intervention and care closer to home when it is safe to do so. The Health Board had planned to review the impact of the pilot in April, however was not able to do so given the COVID 19 situation. The Health Board remains committed to delivering the evidence-based Frailty Pathway and we plan to review the impact of the pilot that took place during January to March 2020 as part of our winter planning process.

The Sam Davies ward continues to provide ongoing assessment and interventions for older patients mainly from the Vale of Glamorgan. The patients occupying this ward are elderly patients, transferred from UHW or UHL at the point at which they no longer require acute hospital inpatient care. Patients continue to receive rehabilitation as well as supported and complex discharge planning at the Sam Davies ward whilst the Frailty Model is established and the future of Barry Hospital agreed.

Should you require any further information, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Yours sincerely

Len Richards
Chief Executive

**Encs** 



# P-05-906 Save Sam Davies Ward at Barry Hospital, Correspondence – Petitioner to Committee, 06.03.20

Thank you for contacting us on this matter.

I have discussed the issue with UNISON's Cardiff and Vale health branch and they have reported that they are comfortable with the current situation around the use of Barry Hospital and, in particular, the Sam Davies ward.

#### P-05-743 End the Exotic Pet Trade in Wales

This petition was submitted by David Sedley and was first considered in March 2017 having collected 222 signatures.

#### Text of the Petition

We call on the National Assembly for Wales to urge the Welsh Government to take action against the trade in exotic animals captured and bred for the pet trade in Wales, and to forbid the licensing of all businesses involved in this destructive, cruel and unethical trade, with clear exemptions for rescue centres and licensed rescue centres. We further urge the Welsh Government to follow the example of the Scottish Government which committed to a review of the trade and importation of exotic animals for the pet trade in Scotland in February 2015, led by The Cabinet Secretary for Rural Affairs and the Environment. For Wales to be taken seriously in the global conservation community, we maintain that we cannot be seen to be allowing this trade – which elicits the concerns of the British Veterinary Association (BVA), The Federation of Veterinarians of Europe (FVE) and the RSPCA – to continue in our own country.

#### Additional Information

Animals such as monkeys, meerkats, reptiles and turtles are wild animals who belong in their natural habitat, not in cages and glass tanks in somebody's home. Over 1000 species of mammals, birds, invertebrates, reptiles, amphibians and fish are bred and captured for the exotic pet trade, and it is our argument that the complex social, physical and behavioural needs of these animals cannot be met other than in their natural habitats. Furthermore, there is strong evidence linking the trade in exotic animals with habitat destruction and the extinction of species in the wild. In tandem with the suffering of such animals in transit – including many documented deaths – young animals can grow into dangerous adults which can become unmanageable in domestic environments not conducive to satisfying their welfare needs for increased space and food.

#### Assembly Constituency and Region.

- Swansea West
- South Wales West

By virtue of paragraph(s) vi of Standing Order 17.42

Document is Restricted

Lesley Griffiths AC/AM Gweinidog yr Amgylchedd, Ynni a Materion Gwledig Minister for Environment, Energy and Rural Affairs



Eich cyf/Your ref P-05-743 Ein cyf/Our ref LG/00616/20

Janet Finch-Saunders AM Chair of the Petitions Committee

Government.Committee.Business@gov.wales

17 August 2020

#### **Dear Janet**

Thank you for your email of 5 March regarding an update on Petition P-05-743 - End the Exotic Pet Trade in Wales.

Welsh Government are committed to maintaining high standards of animal welfare. Officials have been working with the Animal Welfare Network Wales to draft a new Code of Practice for the Welfare of Primates, which highlights their complex needs. however work on this has been paused due to the impact of COVID and will not be progressed before the Senedd elections.

Regards

**Lesley Griffiths AC/AM** 

Gweinidog yr Amgylchedd, Ynni a Materion Gwledig Minister for Environment, Energy and Rural Affairs

> Bae Caerdydd • Cardiff Bay Caerdydd • Cardiff

Canolfan Cyswllt Cyntaf / First Point of Contact Centre: 0300 0604400

<u>Gohebiaeth.Lesley.Griffiths@llyw.cymru</u>
Correspondence.Lesley.Griffiths@gov.wales

Rydym yn croesawu derbyn gohebiaeth yn Gymraeg. Byddwn yn ateb gohebiaeth a dderbynnir yn Gymraeg yn Gymraeg ac ni fydd gohebu yn Gymraeg yn arwain at oedi.

### P-05-864 Ban the use of 'Hostile Architecture'

This petition was submitted by People Over Profit having collected 120 signatures

### **Text of Petition**

We call on the Welsh Government to ban the use of "Hostile Architecture" by organisations to deter homeless people from seeking shelter and any other street structures designed to impede or hide the homeless.

## **Senedd Constituency and Region**

- Neath
- South Wales West

Julie James AS/MS Y Gweinidog Tai a Llywodraeth Leol Minister for Housing and Local Government



Eich cyf/Your ref: P-05-864 Ein cyf/Our ref: JJ/01875/20

Janet Finch-Saunders MS Chair, Petitions Committee

5 August 2020

Dear Janet,

Thank you for your letter of 22 July, regarding the Petitions Committee's consideration of a petition calling for the ban on the use of hostile architecture in Wales.

Since I last wrote to you in April, we have finalised the Placemaking Chater and are preparing a short guide that will expand on what placemaking means in Wales. I will be launching the initiative on the 23 September at the 2020 RTPI Cymru Planning Conference.

The Placemaking Partnership is made of organisations involved in shaping the built and natural environment. A number of housing organisations are involved, including Community Housing Cymru, and, once launched, we will be encouraging other stakeholders to sign up to the charter. The future work programme for this initiative is yet to be set, however, should issues pertaining to the design of public places generally or hostile architecture specifically be addressed, I will ensure organisations which support homeless people are involved in this.

Yours sincerely,

Julie James AS/MS

Y Gweinidog Tai a Llywodraeth Leol Minister for Housing and Local Government

Canolfan Cyswllt Cyntaf / First Point of Contact Centre: 0300 0604400

Gohebiaeth.Julie.James@llyw.cymru Correspondence.Julie.James@gov.Wales

Bae Caerdydd • Cardiff Bay Caerdydd • Cardiff CF99 1SN

Rydym yn croesawu derbyn gohebiaeth yn Gymraeg. Byddwn yn ateb gohebiaeth a dderbynnir yn Gymraeg yn Gymraeg ac ni fydd gohebu yn Gymraeg yn arwain at oedi.